

An Evaluation of English Program at Pesantren Ali Maksum

Syaiful Mujab; Yuyun Yulia

yuyun.yulia@ustjogja.ac.id

Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa

Abstract

This research is aimed at describing the implementation of English program at Pesantren Ali Maksum in terms of the Community Language Learning, and reveal the strengths and weaknesses of English program in English teaching and learning process in Pesantren Ali Maksum in terms of Community Language Learning (CLL).

This research is an evaluation research employing CLL model by Larsen-Freeman (2000) and Richard-Rodger (2003). The data were collected through in-depth interviews, observation and document analysis. The data were analyzed using Miles, Huberman and Saldana's flow model of qualitative data research which included data collection, data condensation, data display and conclusion drawing.

The implementation of English program indicates that English program has been generally well-conducted through six characteristics and eight activities although from some parts need to be improved or changed such as in Larsen-Freeman characteristics. Aggression item the tutor needs to keep a distance to junior students to avoid disrespectful. Richard-Rodger activities term has been well-implemented through eight activities some needs improvement and change. Translation term, the tutor needs training. Group work and listening terms need a change in managing the place in order to avoid disturbance each group.

Keywords: *Community Language Learning; English program; evaluation*

Background

Recently, many pesantrens are moving to follow the modern period with creating a new brand. Ali Maksum is one of modern pesantren which orders an English Program to prepare their students to master in English competence especially in speaking skill. In learning English the new students often feel anxiety and ashamed because they have no basic in English. English programs is used to create English language community in Pesantren Ali Maksum in order to reduce the anxiety and embarrassment learning English such the new students are shy to speak up because they are new comer in Pesantren and do not recognize pesantren environment yet.

English Program is focused on the new students. The program is expected to improve students' interest in English. It is held at night that starts approximately 08.pm. – 09.pm. before study club program. It places in Mosque (*mushola*) of Pesantren Ali Maksum. The students are divided into some groups. each group consists of 5 to 10 learners with an appropriate tutor. The teachers monitor during the learning process as a counselor. The program emphasizes speaking skill. Therefore the students may use the target language as a communication in *Pondok Pesantren Ali Maksum* after finishing the program.

The researcher conducted an evaluation on the implementation of English Program at Pesantren Ali Maksum using CLL (community Language Learning) Model which based on Larsen-Freeman and Richard and Rodger theories because so far there has been no evaluation program on the implementation of this system, thus, the strengths and weaknesses of the program have not been revealed.

This research limits the problem, focus on the evaluation in the process of English program for male students at *Pesantren Ali Maksum* using Community Language Learning.

The problems formulations of this research are: How is the implementation of English program at Pesantren Ali Maksum? And what are the strengths and weaknesses of English program at Pesantren Ali Maksum?

Literature Review

The effectiveness in Teaching and Learning

Cooper and McIntyre contend (1998:3) the dominant model of the 1970s for research into teaching effectiveness was the *process-product* model, at the heart of which was the examination of correlations between *product measures* of, for example, desired pupil attainments and selected *process measures* of classroom activities hypothesized to be conducive to these desired outcomes. Mc. Ardle adds (2010:235) the process of evaluating a training program is outlined, and the outcomes used to evaluating that training are described in detail

Based on the previous indicators, it can be inferred that the characteristics of effective teaching and learning are the learning objective which can be achieved by students actively by involving in the teaching and learning process.

Evaluation of Learning Program

In the book *Impact Evaluation in Practice*, Paul J. Gertler, Sebastian Martinez, Pratic Premand, Laura B Rawlings, Christel M.J. Vermeersch points out Evaluation is periodic, objective assessment of a planned, ongoing, or complete project, program, or policy. Evaluations are used to answer specific question related to design, implementation and result (2011:7). Furthermore, Mertens and Mc Laughlin notes (2004:17-18) evaluation is the systematic investigation of the merit or worth of an object for the purpose of reducing uncertainty in decision making about that object (Mertens, 1998). Evaluators often use the terms merit and worth.

According to Patton (1997) in Mertens and Mc Laughlin's book of *Research and Evaluation Methods in Special Education* (2004:p18) Merit focuses more on the effectiveness of

the program to achieve its aims while worth focuses on the broader impact of the program. The purpose of evaluation is to obtain an accurate and objective information about a program that is used as a guideline to determine the efficiency and effectiveness of a program. This is necessary so that the information can function optimally (Purwanto, 2010: 3-4).

CLL (Community Language Learning)

a. The characteristics of CLL

The characteristics of CLL, according to Curran in Larsen and Freeman book's *Technique and Principles in Language Teaching* (2000:99-100) are **security** and **aggression**, meaning that students should be given an opportunity to assert themselves, be actively involved, and invest themselves in the learning experience. The third element is **attention**. One of the skills necessary in learning a second or foreign or foreign language is to be able to attend to many factors simultaneously. To make this skill easier to learn, especially at the beginning of the learning process, the teacher helps to narrow the scope of attention

The fourth element, **reflection**, occurred in two different ways in our lesson. The first was when the students reflected on the language as the teacher read the transcript three times. The second was when students were invited to stop and consider the active experience they were having. **Retention** is the fifth element, the integration of the new material that takes place within the whole self. The last element is **discrimination**, sorting out the differences among target language forms.

b. The activities of CLL

Learning activities combine innovative learning tasks and activities with conventional one (Richards and Rodger, 2003: p93-94) such as:

1. *Translation*. Learners form a small circle. A learner whispers a message or meaning he or she wants to express, the teacher translates it into (and may interpret it in) the target language, and the learner repeats the teacher's translation.
2. *Group work*. Learners may engage in various group tasks, such as small-group discussion of a topic, preparing a conversation, preparing a summary of a topic for presentation to another group, preparing a story that will be presented to the teacher and the rest of the class.
3. *Recording*. Students record conversation in the target language.
4. *Transcription*. Students transcribe utterances and conversations they have recorded for practice and analysis of linguistic form.
5. *Analysis*. Students analyze and study transcription of target-language sentences in order to focus on particular lexical usage or on the application of particular grammar rules.
6. *Reflection and observation*. Learner reflect and report on their experience of the class, as a class or in group. This usually consists of expression of feelings-sense of one another, reactions to silence, concern for something to say, and so on.
7. *Listening*. Students listen to a monologue by the teacher involving elements they might have elicited or overhead in class interactions.

8. *Free conversation*. Students engage in free conversation with the teacher or with other learners. This might include discussion of what they learned as well as feeling they had about how they learned.

Both Characteristics and learning activities were kinds of learning that can take place in CLL. Those are summed up into two kinds. Learning is person, which means that whole-person learning of another language takes place best in a relationship of trust, support and cooperation between teacher and students and among the students and learning is dynamic and creative, which means that learning is a living and developmental process.

Methodology

This research uses descriptive that applied based on the theory of Miles, Huberman and Saldana (2014). The purpose of this study is to evaluate English program at Pesantren Ali Maksum. This study employed CLL which is based on characteristics of CLL theory developed by Larsen- Freeman (2000:99-100) and activities of CLL theory developed by Richard-Rodger. There are six characteristics of CLL such as security, aggression, attention, reflection, retention and discrimination. Richard-Rodger (2003:93-94) divided the activities of CLL into eight activities namely translation, group work, recording, transcription, analysis, reflection-observation, listening and free conversation. Thus, this study belongs to an evaluation research. The research participants in this study were the teachers, the head of Pondok Pesantren Ali Maksum and students who were attending English program 2016.

Findings and Discussion

1. The Implementation of English Program at Pesantren Ali Maksum.

a. The Characteristic of Community Language Learning (CLL)

Larsen and Freeman states (2000:89) there are six elements

1. Security

To reduce the anxiety of new students at pondok pesantren, the senior students were involved to be a tutor to teach the new students at Pesantren Ali Maksum. It was quoted fom Mr. Khoirul Fuad as a chief of Pondok Pesantren Ali Maksum.

Jadi dalam pembelajaran bahasa inggris, kami melibatkan anak-anak (santri) yang sudah senior Pesantren Ali Maksum untuk ikut terlibat dalam pengembangan bahasa inggris ya...sebagai tutor seperti guru yaitu yang senior mengajari yang junior. hal ini juga dimaksud mereka mempunyai andil dalam membangun, mengembangkan, serta menjaga bahasa inggris dengan baik. dengan sendirinya maka English area dapat terwujud. Disamping itu biasanya siswa baru cenderung takut dan malu apalagi yang siswa kelas 7 SMP. karena mereka juga jauh dari keluarga sehingga mereka akan merasa asing ketika berada di lingkungan baru nah untuk itu juga anak-anak santri baru dan lama biar bisa lebih akrab di pondok pesantren.

The script 1 above also mentioned about new situation “*di lingkungan baru*” for new student especially for student 7 year. They felt strange in new situation. It caused the new students did not feel enjoy in Pondok pesantren Ali Maksum. This case the intuition involved the senior students became tutors not only learning together with the new students but also the

senior students may become a friendship to new students in order to the new students were enjoy learning in *Pondok Pesantren*

2. Aggression

As the script 1 the intitution wanted to involve the senior students in learning English such as the script below.

Jadi dalam pembelajaran bahasa inggris, kami melibatkan **anak-anak (santri)** yang sudah senior Pesantren Ali Maksum untuk ikut terlibat dalam pengembangan bahasa inggris ya...**sebagai tutor** seperti guru yaitu yang senior mengajar yang junior. **hal ini juga dimaksud mereka mempunyai andil dalam membangun, mengembangkan, serta menjaga bahasa inggris dengan baik. dengan sendirinya maka English area dapat terwujud. Disamping itu biasanya siswa baru cenderung takut dan malu apalagi yang siswa kelas 7 SMP. karena mereka juga jauh dari keluarga sehingga mereka akan merasa asing ketika berada di lingkungan baru nah untuk itu juga anak-anak santri baru dan lama biar bisa lebih akrab di pondok pesantren.**

The script showed that the institution of Pesantren Ali Maksum involved the senior students became tutors. Intitution of Pesantren Ali Maksum wanted there was student's contribution in building, developing and then keeping English language at Pondok Pesantren Ali Maksum.

3. Attention

In the leraning process the tutor gave a simultaneous to the student in order to narrow the scope of attention of the material that discussed. There were many ways in getting students' attention in learning process such as

Pre-teaching (*menggal informasi dan menstimulus siswa untuk focus pada topik pembahasan*)
 Tutor 2 : I'm fine too. Ok guys....
What is a day, day itu artinya apa ya?
 Students : Hari.... (*dengan kompak menjawab*)
 Tutor 2 : How many days in a week?
 Students : *Diam beberapa saat.... dan ada salah satu siswa menjawab seven...*
 Tutor 2 : **Maksudnya how many days in a week itu... ada berapa hari sih dalam satu minggu**
 Students : Ooo.... (*sebagian besar*)...tujuh..seven..tujuh...
 Tutor 2 : **Hari atau Day itu apa saja?**
 Students : *Ahad, minggu, senin,selasa..... jumat sabtu*

The script above showed the tutor asked to the students with “*what is a day - day itu artinya apa ya, how many days* and”. These questions were only the ways of learning process to get students' attention before entering the main topic of the lesson. “*what is a day* then followed by the translation *day itu artinya apa ya*” was very simple question but it had big effect for the students in setting students mind in material of day. After getting students' focus the tutor gave next level question “*how many days in a week*”. It was based on the text the tutor gave some simultaneous in getting students' attention. This activity was very important for the tutor's in order to get successful in learning process.

4. Reflection.

The students reflected on the language as the teacher read the transcript. Students' reflection was needed after teaching and learning process in order to know how far students understand well about the material. as the script below.

Tutor : Ok, Sekarang Chamim Maju kedepan (*Siswa tersebut diminta untuk mengulangi drilling 1*) ok, gimana cukup ya. sebelum kita tutup. *apa ada pertanyaan any questions?*

The script showed. There was students' involvement in learning process. It was showed the tutor asked one of the students to do review the lesson that had been discussed in front their

friends. At this time the tutor also evaluated students' understanding about the material of day. it was based on the text the student reviewed the material through drilling1.

5. Retention.

The activity that showed there was retention of the material. The students did not only understand about days in English but also the students produced the pronunciation correctly as it was seen in the script of "*Tuesday* and *Thursday*" there was an emphasisment in learning process of pronouncing the word "*Tuesday* and *Thursday*".

6. Discrimination.

The students refined the material of day to use to communicate such as the activity in the dialogue below

Kemudian dilanjutkan kelompok 2, dan tutor berada ditengah mereka untuk mendengarkan cara pengucapan siswa
Student 1 dan student 2
 Student 1 : What day is today?
 Student 2 : Today is Monday eeehh....salah Wednesday (dengan pronounee yang salah).
 Tutor : Mengkoreksi yang salah.... Wednesday (dengan pronounee yang benar), lanjutkan lagi go on...
 Student 1 : What day is yesterday?
 Student 2 : Yesterday is Tuesday (terdapat kesalahan pronounee) kemudian tutor mengkoreksi bagaimana cara pengucapan yang benar.
 Student 1 : What day is tomorrow?
 Student 2 : Tomorrow is Thursday. (terdapat kesalahan pronounee) kemudian tutor mengkoreksi bagaimana cara pengucapan yang benar.

The activity in the script above showed the student practiced the dialogue about day. The student's question "*what day is today*" and another student answered incorrectly but after a few later the student revised *Wednesday*. In term Wednesday the student's got wrong pronunciation. Then the tutor corrected the right pronunciation

b. The Learning Activities of English Program Using CLL

According to Richard and Rodger in his book *Approaches and Method in Language Teaching*, CLL combines innovative learning tasks and activities with conventional one. They include (2003: p93-94).

1. Translation.

The script showed that there was interpret between tutor (senior student) and the student in delivering the lesson. They were using two languages in learning process in order to undertand the student about the instruction.

Pre-Learning
(menggali informasi dan menstimulus siswa untuk focus pada topic pembahasan)
 Tutor 2 : Ok guys,,,, **Tonight our lesson is Days**
 What is Day, Day itu artinya apa ya?
 Students : Hari..... (dengan kompak menjawab)
 Tutor 2 : How many days in a week?
 Students : Hampir semua siswa diam dan terdengar ada suara lirih 7...7 kayaknya
 Tutor 2 : Maksudnya **how many days in a week** itu,,, **ada berapa hari sih**
 dalam satu minggu
 Students : Ooo.....(sebagian besar)... seven,, tujuh,,,
 Tutor 2 : **Hari** atau **Day** itu apa saja?
 Students : Ahad, minggu, senin,selasa.....jumat sabtu

As shown the script above, there was translation activity in the learning process, the tutor gave a question **how many days** but nearly most students are quiet. after translating to the first

language “*ada berapa hari sih*” the students immediately answered there are “**seven**” then there is a student said “ada tujuh” briefly.

2. Group work. Learners may engage in various group tasks, such as small-group discussion of a topic, preparing a conversation, preparing a summary of a topic for presentation to another group, preparing a story that will be presented to the teacher and the rest of the class

Tutor : *Sekarang ini akan saya bagi menjadi beberapa group satu group terdiri dari 2 orang, nanti maju satu persatu (pergrup) dan sebelumnya silahkan dialog ini dipraktikkannya dengan temennya.*
 Tutor memberikan waktu selama beberapa menit dan jangan membawa buku catatan

This script showed the tutor asked the students to seek the partner in preparing their conversation in front of the class without having a note. The tutor gave the students a few minutes to prepare the conversation with the partner. Students practiced only and did not make a new conversation

3. Recording.

Tutor 2 : **Repeat after me tirukan setelah saya** kemudian tutor membaca dan mengartikan kemudian siswa menirukannya.
 Tutor 2 : **Sunday – Ahad**
 Students : **Sunday – Ahad**
 Tutor 2 : **Monday – Senin**
 Students : **Monday – Senin**
 Tutor2 : **Tuesday – Selasa 3x**
 Students : **Tuesday – Selasa 3x**
 Tutor2 : **Wednesday – Rabu**
 Students : **Wednesday- Rabu**
 Tutor 2 : **Thursday – Kamis 3x**
 Students : **Thursday – Kamis 3x**
 Tutor 2 : **Friday – Jumat**
 Students : **Friday – Jumat**
 Tutor 2 : **Saturday – Sabtu**
 Students : **Saturday – Sabtu**

“**Repeat after me tirukan setelah saya**” showed that activity of recording, the student recorded the lesson by repeating tutor’s drilling during learning process.

4. Transcription.

Tutor 2 : *Sambil menulis dan berbicara (speak up.) Sunday sama dengan Ahad/Minggu, Monday-Senin, Tuesday -Selasa, Wednesday -rabu, Thursday- Kamis, Kemudian Friday itu jumat dan Saturday - sabtu.*
 Tutor 2 : *(kemudian para siswa di suruh untuk menulis tentang Days) please write on your book! tulislah dibukumu!*
 Students.: Ok sir,, siap,,
 Tutor 2 : Finish? sudah selesai
 Students.: Yes sir,,
 Tutor 2 : listen carefully... dengarkan ya... (kemudian Tutor 2 membaca dan mengartikan tentang Days dari mulai Sunday: ahad, – Saturday: sabtu)

This script, the student wrote the lesson “day” and after finishing writing the tutor asked the student to listen what the tutor was saying. In this case, the student doing transcription was not only writing the text but also transcript how to pronounce the word.

5. Analysis.

Tutor : *Sekarang ini akan saya bagi menjadi beberapa group satu group terdiri dari 2 orang, nanti maju satu persatu (pergrup) dan sebelumnya silahkan dialog ini dipraktekkan dengan baik dengan temennya. Tutor memberikan waktu selama beberapa menit dan jangan membawa buku catatan.*

Tutor : *Sekarang silahkan maju Kelompok 1 (posisi tutor berada ditengah mereka untuk mendengarkan dialogue siswa)*

Student 1 dan student 2
 Student 1 : What day is today?
 Student 2 : Today is Wednesday
 Student 1 : What day is yesterday?
 Student 2 : Yesterday is Tuesday
 Student 1 : What day is tomorrow?
 Student 2 : Tomorrow is Thursday.

The script above explained that the tutor instructed the student to practice the dialogue well. In practicing the dialogue the students produced **“What day is today”** then the student 2 answered **“Today is Wednesday”**. It means both two students used right grammatical rules in asking and answering the question.

6. Reflection and observation.

Student 4 : Sir maaf ni denger-denger yesterday itu lampau ko ini pake is ndak was

Tutor 2 : Iyap betul sekali, that right (sambil memberikan jari jempol ke student 4) good question. nah begini ini kenapa kita pakai is biar seragam dulu ya sir (sambil menoleh ke guru pendamping)

Teacher : That's right betul sekali namun sebenarnya bukan masalah seragam namun lebih kepada fungsinya yaitu simple present itu mempunyai fungsi salah satunya adalah kebenaran umum yaitu yang namanya yesterday atau kemaren ya hari itu. misal kalau hari ini senin kemaren ya Minggu atau Ahad. apa itu simple present biar kalian ndak tambah bingung nah baiknya pembahasan ini (simple present) akan kita jelaskan nanti ya kalau materinya sudah nyampe situ.

Students : Ok sir, Siaap

The script showed there was student's reflection on disagreement using **“is”** in word **“yesterday”** it means that the students expressed their feeling to the tutor or teacher when they had something to say.

7. Listening.

The activity of listening, the tutor asked the student to listen carefully such as the script below

Tutor 2 : **listen carefully... dengarkan ya... (kemudian Tutor 2 membaca dan mengartikan tentang Days dari mulai Sunday - Ahad/Minggu, Monday-Senin, Tuesday -Selasa, Wednesday- rabu, Thursday-Kamis, Kemudian Friday itu jumat dan Saturday - Sabtu.**

The script above explained that the students listened to the tutor about the material “day”. In listening activity the student might imitate what the tutor had said with right pronunciation.

8. Free conversation.

Free conversation here was preparing the dialogue to practice in front of the class with the partner as the script below

Kemudian tutor meminta siswa untuk mempraktekkan dialogue tersebut didepan kelas. namun sebelum maju ke depan semua siswa diminta mencari partner atau pasangan kemudia latihan terlebih dahulu dan setelah siap maka para siswa diminta untuk maju ke depan.

*Tutor : Sekarang ini akan saya bagi menjadi beberapa group satu group terdiri dari 2 orang, nanti maju satu persatu (pergrup) dan sebelumnya silahkan dialog ini dipraktekkannya dengan temennya.
Tutor memberikan waktu selama beberapa menit dan jangan membawa buku catatan*

The script above showed the student might look for the partner to practice the conversation in front of the classroom but before it the students practiced the conversation with their partner.

2. The Strengths And Weaknesses Of English Program At Pesantren Ali Maksum

The following is the detailed discussion in terms of the strengths and weakness of English program at Pesantren Ali Maksum.

1. The Strengths of English Program

According to Larsen and Freeman there are six characteristic of CLL. In terms of security, tutors had a contribution in reducing students' anxiety and ashamed in a new situation (pondok pesantren). The duration of meeting intensively of the senior students who became tutor and the new students who became tutee created a new familiy. Aggression, the involvement of the students became a tutor might increase their knowledge in English. They became a responsible student and also they might be good friend for the new students. Attention, the tutor gave some simultaneous to get the students attention before entering to the main topic of the lesson. This activity created the effectiveness and interesting learning. Reflection. The students' reflection was on dissagrement using "tobe-is" in the sentence "yesterday". It could increase student braveness in expressing something. Retention, dealing with retention, the students learned the material about day in English and its pronounciation. Discrimination. The student might produce a good question based on the pattern of grammar rules in dialy activity in Pesantren Ali Maksum.

In teaching and learning activities, the tutors do CLL's activity well such as Translation. In doing translation activity the tutor might enrich their vocabulary and knowledge. Group work. Designing with small group the students might practice the dialogue more intensif. The result of this the students may increase the speaking ability more fluently than before. Recording. This activity, the student recorded the target language through tutor's drilling the lesson. It was easier for the students to catch lesson especially in pronouncing the word. Recording activity also increased the student's memory. Transcription, The transcription activity, the students may practice the dialogue with their partner with right pronounciation. The students were able to write a word or sentence correctly. Analysis, In this activity the students may identify the right sentences and may speak English with the right pattern. Reflection and observation. The students were able to critic to the tutor if the student did not feel satisfied about the lesson. This activity may increase the braveness of the student to express their idea or opinion. Listening. The students were able to catch then imitated the words what the tutor had said. and The students also

may respond or answer the teacher's question correctly. Free conversation. the student may express the feeling what they had learned

2. The Weaknesses of English Program

Six characteristics of CLL that applied in this program, there was one weakness in term of aggression. Dealing with the the student's aggression, the involvement of the senior students made were lost control and not respect to their senior because they felt that they were closed friend. In learning activities of CLL some of eight terms were found in terms of Translation. The ability of tutor's translation was still low so sometimes the tutor could not answer students' questions. Group work. The design of place in English Program was one place in Mosque. It made interruption voices among the group because the arrangement of the group was very closed each other. Transcription, The knowledge of the tutors' pronunciation needed to be upgrade. The student followed the tutor's pronunciation even it was wrong pronunciation. Listening, The designing of place in English program was too closed each others so it made the activity of listening was not condusive.

Conclusion

There has been no evaluation of the program. The evaluation actually may give a good decision to improve the quality of teaching and learning program for English program. The implementation of English program fulfills Larsen-Freeman and Richard-Rodger's theory. Larsen and Freeman stated there were six characteristic. In term of security the involvement of senior student created comfortable in learning English. Aggression, some senior students were involved in building, developing and keeping English language in Pondok Pesantren. Then attention, the simultaneous which based on the topic of the lesson were needed to get student's attention. Reflection term, the students expressed their feeling during the learning process. Retention, the student was able to integrate the new material that takes place within the whole self and the last Discrimination, the student produce and practice the dialogue with good pronunciation.

Rodger and Richard stated there were eight activities. It can be concluded In terms of translation activity, the tutor's instruction and explanation make the student understand well. Group work activity the students practice the conversation with the partners. Recording activity the students listen to the teacher's explanation carefully. Transcription activity the students write the material that has been given. Analysis activities the students give respond to partner correctly. Reflection and observation activity the students react about their feelings to the tutor. Listening activity the students listen to the teacher's monologue then the student concern to the pronunciation and in the free conversation activity the student do a dialogue to other students.

The results of the program indicate that English program is well-conducted although from six characteristic and the eight activities there are some parts to be improved such as in Larsen-Freeman characteristics in *aggression* some junior student (tutee) did not respect to some senior students. Richard-Rodger theory there were some parts to improve such as *work group* and *listening* activity the design of place made interruption among the group because the arrangement of the group was very closed each other. *Transcription* the tutor did the wrong pronunciation the tutor needed to be up grade in learning pronunciation.

References

- Cooper. P and McIntyre .D, 1998. *Effective Teaching and Learning Teacher's and Student's Perspectives*. 1998. Philadelphia. Open University Press.
- Larsen. D and Freeman. 2000. *Techniques and Principles in Language Teaching* UK. Oxford University Press.
- McNiff, J & Whitehead, J. 2002. *Action Research: Principles And Practice* London: Routledge Falmer.
- Mc Ardle.G. 2010. *Instructional Design for Action Learning*. United States of America. Amacom.
- Mertens. D. M and Mc Laughlin. J.A. 2004. *Research and Evaluation Methods in Special Education*. California. Corwin Press.
- Miles, H and Saldana. 2014. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. London. SAG
- Paul J. G, Martinez S, Premand P, Laura BR, Christel M.J, Vermeersch. 2011 *Impact evaluation in practice*. Washington DC. The World Bank.
- Sugiyono. 2007. *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan (Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif dan R&D)*. Bandung. Alfabeta.
- Richards, J.S and Rodger,T. 2003. *Approaches and Methods In Language Teaching Second Edition*. UK. Cambridge University Press.