Evaluation on senior high school English textbooks

Yosyie Azharia Winimurti 1 *, Dedi Rahman Nur 2

1 Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa. Jalan Kusumanegara No.157, Yogyakarta 55165, Indonesia
2 Universitas Widya Gama Mahakam Samarinda. Jalan Wahid Hasyim 2 No.28, Samarinda, 75243, Indonesia

*Corresponding author. Email: yosyieuw@gmail.com

Abstract

In Indonesia, English teachers use textbooks to help students in the teaching-learning process and use it as a self-help resource to get rich input in learning. To improve the quality of English language teaching in Indonesia, this research was conducted to measure whether the three books used in Senior High School, i.e. “Bahasa Inggris”, “Pathway to English”, and “Outcomes Upper Intermediate” are right or not. This research used Alan Cunningsworth’s theory on excellent textbook and tried to find the strengths and weaknesses of the three books based on the given methods above. The study was conducted using evaluation research to evaluate the three English textbooks used by some schools in Yogyakarta. Evaluation steps included taking some samples from the books to see whether they meet the criteria of good textbooks that the researcher developed based on Cunningsworth’s framework. The research found out that Bahasa Inggris meets five standards: aims and approaches, design and organisation, topic, teachers’ book, and political consideration. Pathway to English meets four standards of excellent textbook by Cunningsworth: aims and approaches, design and organisation, teachers’ book, and political attention. Outcomes Upper Intermediate matches five principles of excellent manual by Cunningsworth: goals and methods, design and organisation, skills, topic, and teachers’ book. The researcher also found out that the strengths and weaknesses of “Bahasa Inggris”, “Pathway to English”, and “Outcomes Upper Intermediate”. From the findings above, the researcher suggests the teacher use three textbooks in the teaching-learning process because three books meet the criteria in a good book.

Keywords: criteria of good textbook; textbooks; evaluation

Introduction

English textbook is a basic resource to determine the quality of language input and the language practices during teaching learning process in an English course. Its functions are not only as a guidance of teaching and learning but also as a developing material as well as a substantial and observable component of pedagogy content. All aforementioned functions, as stated by Graves and Xu (2000, p.151), contain the decisions about developing materials, which are rooted in the beliefs, understanding, and experience. In general, materials in a textbook also depend on the goals and objectives, the ways to conceptualize the content of the course, the ways to organize and sequence the course, and the understanding of the students’ needs.

Textbook possesses an important role in the national education system because it reflects the changes in Indonesia curriculum system. When a new curriculum is implemented, a number of textbooks are published. In response to this, the government of Indonesia via the Ministry of Education and Culture has made some laws in the form of regulations for designing, using, and evaluating textbooks. The government publishes a list of textbooks which are considered appropriate to be used in teaching learning process.

In 2017, a new series of textbook published by Kemendikbud was introduced and used textbooks for English teaching learning process in senior high school in grades 10, 11, and 12. This also occurred in schools in Bantul Regency. Since the textbooks replaced the previous books used in senior high schools in the province of Yogyakarta, where Bantul Regency is located, it has been a subject of much controversy among teaching staff. Some teachers are enthusiastic about the books, saying they are carefully planned and relevant to current ELT trends in Indonesia. Other argue that, carefully planned as they are, the books may not be useful
because they have been designed to suit the needs of learners in more developed areas which are socially, culturally, and politically speaking different from isolated areas. Some teachers regard the series as a helpful guide, showing teachers and learners where they are going and what are coming next, so that there is a sense of structure progress. Those who are opposed to those textbooks say they contain uninteresting material with irrelevant topics, which do not cater to the needs students, and which may inhabit teachers’ initiative and intuitive rather than based on empirical evidence.

This researcher decided to perform an attempt to evaluate three of these textbooks; "Bahasa Inggris”, “Pathway to English”, and “Outcomes Upper Intermediate”, which are for senior high students learning English. This textbook evaluation would be carried out in two schools in Bantul regency. The participants in the study would be some teachers using the textbooks for the school year of 2018/2019. The data were collected from teachers and document review through the following instruments; observation; interview with teachers; and some documents (the 2013 Curriculum and syllabi). The research aimed to elucidate the strengths and weaknesses of the books which used in teaching and learning process, especially in Bantul (SMA Negeri 1 Sewon and SMA Negeri 1 Bantul), and to know whether the three English textbooks meet the level of good textbooks referring to evaluation criteria developed by the researcher based on Cunningsworth’s good textbook criteria.

Based on the limitation of the problem, the researcher attempted to answer the following questions: (1) Do the three English textbooks fulfill the criteria of good books by Cunningsworth?; (2) What strengths and weaknesses do the three English textbooks used by eleventh grade of senior high school have?

Literature Review

English Language Teaching

Language is an important aspect of human life. Through the language, some interact with each other. In the word, language is a resource for social life. According to Douglas, language is used for communication and acquired by all people in much the same way; language and language learning both have universal characteristics. Then, in this era of globalization, English is one of the most widespread languages and plays a great role among other languages in the international relations.

Textbook Evaluation

In general, textbook evaluation refers to the process of making judgements of its appropriateness based on certain criteria. Cunningsworth (1995) says that the judgment process will be based on the views and priorities of any parties conducting it. Further, Celce-Murcia (2001) believes that this categorized as complex process performed in different ways. They vary from a teacher own decision process, a centralized process, and a more decentralized approach. Based on the data got from the conformity of Solatif with the 2013 Curriculum, it can be summarized that the materials in Solatif covers eight KDs for the seventh grade of junior high school, meaning that it accommodates all what is needed by the students for seventh grade of junior high school. Mandiri. It covers seven KDs for the seventh grade of junior high school. Unfortunately, it does not cover one of the last KD (Jannah & Robiasih, 2019).

Textbooks Evaluation Criteria by Cunningsworth

The first criterion, aims and approaches, seek to answer the question on whether the aims of the textbook correspond closely with aims of teaching program and with the needs of the learners. It should match with the learners’ needs in the major areas, namely language item, skills, and communicative strategies. It can reflect learners’ content and communicative needs. As a result, the materials should flexible and allows different teaching and learning style.

The second criterion is design and organization, and it is about how the content is organized (e.g., according to structures, function, topics, skills, etc.), how the content is sequenced (e.g., on the basis of complexity, learn ability, usefulness, etc.), whether the grading and progression are suitable for the learners, and whether it allows them to complete the work needed to meet any external syllabus requirements. Besides, the content presented earlier is thought to be simpler than later item.

The third criterion, language content, seeks to answer the questions about whether the textbook covers the main grammar items which are appropriate to each level and takes learners’ need into account, whether the material for vocabulary teaching is adequate in terms of quantity and range of vocabulary, emphasis placed on vocabulary development and strategies for individual learning, whether the textbook includes material for pronunciation work (individual sound, word stress, sentence, stress, intonation, and so on), whether the textbook deals with the structuring and conventions of language use above sentence level (for example, how to take part in conversations, how to structure a piece of extended writing, how to identify the main points in a reading passage), and whether style and appropriate are dealt with (if so it should be questioned whether language style is matched to social situation). Furthermore, textbooks should consider the language beyond the classroom to equip the learners to use language effectively for their purposes.

The fourth, the criterion of skills, seeks to answer the questions whether all skills are adequately covered, bearing in mind the lesson objectives and syllabus requirements, whether there is material for integrated skill work, whether reading passages and associated activities help comprehension, whether the material is for integrated skill works, whether reading passage and associated activities are suitable for the students’ levels, interests, etc., whether the listening material is well recorded, as authentic as possible, accompanied by background information, questions, and activities which help comprehension, whether the material is for spoken English (dialogues, role plays, etc.) and well designed to equip learners for real-life interactions, and whether writing activities are suitable in terms of amount of guidance control, disagree of accuracy, organization of longer pieces of writing and use of appropriate styles.

The fifth criterion, topic, seeks to answer the questions of whether there are sufficient materials of genuine interest to learners, whether the topic will help expand students’ awareness and enrich their experience, whether the topics are sophisticated enough in content, yet within the learners’ language level, whether the students will be able to relate to the social and cultural contexts presented in the textbook. Textbook should have a variety of task and topics as powerful factors to boost the learners’ motivation in learning process.

Sixth, methodology, seeks to answer the questions of what approach or approaches to learning are taken by the textbook and whether it is appropriate to the teaching learning situation, what level of active learner involvement can be expected and whether this matches the students’ learning styles and expectations, what techniques are used for presenting new language items and whether they are suitable for the learners, how communicative abilities are developed, whether the material includes any advice to students are expected to take a degree of responsibility for their own learning (e.g., by setting their own individual learning targets).

Teachers’ book, the seventh criterion, seeks to answer the questions of whether there is adequate guidance for teachers who will be using the course book and its supporting materials, whether the teachers’ books are comprehensive and supportive, whether they adequately cover teaching techniques, language items such as grammar rules and culture-specific information,
whether keys to exercises are given. It provides ready-made materials, texts ideas for teaching exercises and tasks.

The last, political consideration, seeks to answer the questions what the whole package costs and whether this represents good value for money, whether the books are strong and long-lasting, whether they are attractive in appearance, whether they are easy to obtain and whether further supplies can be obtained at a short notice, and whether any parts of the package require particular equipment, such as a language laboratory, listening center, or video player and whether it is reliable. If so, schools must have the equipment available for the students.

Based on explanation above, it can be concluded that instructional material is crucial in teaching learning process to facilitate and allow the acquisition of knowledge to take place. Therefore all teachers’ designed materials to be used in learning process can systematically be arranged in accordance with the standards of competence in order to ensure that learning goals are to be easily achieved by the students.

**Description of the Textbooks**

**Bahasa Inggris**

*Bahasa Inggris* is a series of English textbooks for uses by senior high school level published by Kementrian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia. It has three series, for grades X, XI, and IX, all having the same title. For eleventh grade students, this book was written by Mahrukh Bashir, Emi Emilia, and Lina Mulyani and was published in 2017. *Bahasa Inggris* for eleventh graders of senior high school has 170 pages and eight units. The titles of each unit are “Offer and Suggestions”, “Opinion and Thoughts”, “Party Time”, “National Disaster An Exposition”, “Later Writing”, “Cause and Effect”, “Meaning Through Music”, and “Explain This”.

**Pathway to English**

*Pathway to English (PTE)* is a series of English textbooks for senior high school published by a well-known Indonesian publisher, Erlangga. Similar to that of previous textbook, *Pathway to English* is also designed to be used as English learning materials for grades X, XI, and IX, with the same title for each grade. *PTE* was written by Th. M. Sudarwati and Audia Grace. Like *Bahasa Inggris* textbook, it was also published first in 2017. This book has 169 pages and consists of nine units. Titles of each unit in the book are “You Should Keep Your Environment Clean”, “I Think So, Too”, “We Cordially Invite You”, “Why is It a Good Habit”, “It's Made of GLASS”, “Dear Beloved Mother”, “Because of You”, “How does It Occur?”, and “I’d Like to Teach The World to Sing”.

**Outcomes Upper Intermediate**

*Outcomes Upper Intermediate* is a series of International English textbooks for senior high school published by Cengage ELT. It has two series, B1 and B2, with both having the same title. The Outcomes book was written by Hugh Dellar and Andrew Walkley and was published in 2010. This book has 183 pages and consists of eight units. Titles of each unit are “Entertainment”, “Sightseeing”, “Thing you need”, “Society”, “Sports and interests”, “Accommodation”, “Nature”, and “Law and order”.

**Method**

In this research, the researcher was to evaluate the three English textbooks that were used by some schools in Bantul as the research object. The researcher did the evaluation by taking some samples from the book to see whether the books meet the criteria of good textbooks that the researcher has developed based on Cunningsworth’s framework. The framework for material evaluation used in this study was explained in previously in Literature Review section.
Object of the Study

The objects of the study are the three English textbooks for eleventh grade senior high school entitled “Bahasa Inggris”, “Pathway to English”, and “Outcomes Upper Intermediate”, all going to be matched with criteria of good textbooks that the researcher had developed based on Cunningsworth’s framework.

The first one is entitled “Bahasa Inggris”. Published by Kementrian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia in 2017, this book is declared to be in line with the implementation of newly design curriculum, the 2013 Curriculum. There are eight units in this textbook, which cover listening, speaking, reading and writing skills that are graded and mirrored to real-life situations.

The second one is Pathway to English written by Th. M. Sudarwati and Eudia Grace published Erlangga. There are nine units in this book, which cover listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills are that graded resemble real-life situations. The book contains sections having points about sharing user’s experiences, cultural awareness, and self-reflection.

The last one is an international English textbook entitled Outcomes Upper Intermediate. Written by Hugh Dellar and Andrew Walkley and published Cengage ELT, this book is divided into sixteen separate units, which cover listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills. There are grammar, vocabulary, reading and listening in the sections of each unit.

Research Instrument

The main role of the researcher here was the research instrument to collect the data. Lincoln Guba in Sugiyono (2010, p.300) says, “The instrument of choice in content analysis in human. We shall see that other forms of instrument may be used in later phrases of inquiry, but the human is the initial and continuing mainstay”.

According to Creswell in Rachman, Nur, Sunarti, & Puspita (2018) in qualitative research, the main methods include observation, in-depth individual interviews, focus groups, biographical methods such as life histories and narratives, and analysis of documents and texts. Moreover, qualitative researcher as the human instrument has a function to state the research focus, select informant as a data source, compile the data, judge the quality of the data, analyze the data, interpret the data, and make a conclusion about his/her findings. (Sugiyono, 2010)

The instrument of collecting data used in this research was criteria of good textbook that researcher has developed based on Alan Cunningsworth’s framework

Data Collection Technique

There are three techniques for collecting the data in this research: observation, document analysis, and interview.

Observation

The data from this study was collected through several steps of observation (1) The researcher observed the content of the three textbooks by reading them carefully and thoroughly; (2) The researcher compared the content of the textbooks with the criteria of good textbooks based on the criteria of good textbooks as arranged by the researcher based on Cunningsworth’s framework.

Interview

The researcher also conducted an interview with the teacher to know competencies to be achieved in the textbooks and check the data that researcher got from teacher. The interview was conducted in order to know how teacher teach using the textbooks.
Teachers Interview

The researcher conducted an interview to find out how teacher uses the textbooks. The researcher collected information from an English teacher on how the books are used to conduct a learning process and whether the process succeeds or not, as well as the teacher’s academic background and the teacher’s opinions about the book.

Students Interview

The researcher interviewed several students to get some information about the use of textbooks in class. The researchers wanted to know whether the book could make students enthusiastic during the teaching learning process, and whether the contents of the book are already appropriate and match with the level in school.

Document Analysis

Sugiyono (2010), as cited in Nursakina (2018), states that document analysis is the complement for use of observation in qualitative research. The document can be in the form of picture, syllabus, lesson plan, and script related to the evaluation of the particular textbooks. Since the subject of this research is in the form of the textbook the researcher used document analysis to collect the data such as the content of the textbook.

Data Analysis Technique

Qualitative data analysis was employed in this research. According to Mile and Huberman (2014) the activity in the analysis of qualitative data is conducted continuously until it is complete. Activity in data analysis is collection, data reduction, data displays, and giving the conclusion. In analyzing the data, the researcher used the following step based on Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña (2014).

Data collection

The researcher collected the data through the techniques defined before. The data of this research were taken through the observation, based on the plan, do, and see activities. First, Classified the strengths and weaknesses of the textbooks based on content of the textbooks related to the evaluation criteria of good textbooks as arranged by the researcher based on the Cunningsworth framework’s evaluation textbook criteria. Second, Identified the strengths and weaknesses of the textbooks based on the content of the textbooks related to the criteria fulfilments. Some sample activities, tasks or pictures from the three textbooks were selected as supporting evidence whether the textbooks fulfilled the criteria of good textbooks as arranged by the researcher based on Alan Cunningsworth framework. After collecting, reducing, and displaying data, the researcher drew a conclusion based on the result of the research.

Findings and Discussion

The researcher analyzed three textbooks in this research. Those books were chosen based on the curriculum used in those books and based on familiarity with the teacher. The researcher found the appropriateness between materials written in the textbook entitled “Bahasa Inggris” (T1), “Pathway to English” (T2), and “Outcomes Upper Intermediate” (T3) based on the criteria of good textbook by Cunningsworth (1995). The criteria include aim and approaches, design and organization, language content, skills, topic, methodology, teachers book, and political consideration.

The results of the research are summarized as follow tables which are then elaborated:
Aims and Approaches

For point (a), the aims and approaches of the three books have are suitable. The KIs/KDs (core/basic competences) and teaching program of the three books match with the syllabus, lesson plan, and textbook. For point (b), the materials of the three textbooks are intended for eleventh grade students. The materials are selected based on the needs of the students. The students’ needs such as expression vocabulary, giving opinion, asking giving and receiving. The students can learn by practicing with their friends. For point (c), the textbooks are suitable with the learning and teaching situation because the lesson plans and the activities influence students, making them interested in learning. The activities are role play reenacting the conversation in the classroom. For point (d), the materials and exercises presented in the three textbooks are suitable with the basic competences of the 2013 Curriculum. Beside that the materials and exercise match with the students’ levels.

Design and Organization

The second criterion of good textbook by Cunningsworth is design and organization. There are four points related to design and organization based on the criteria of good textbook according to Cunningsworth (1995). For point (a), the three textbooks have proven to be suitable with the components of course package. One example of evidence that textbooks are suitable with students’ needs are pre activity in Chapter 1 about suggestion (see page 4), and expressing agreement with opinion (see page 10). However, the researcher found the material did not match the students’ needs. For example: functional text; invitation card, poster and brochure. For point (b), the contents organized in the textbooks such as; structure, topic, and skills are suitable. The structure is organized from simple to complex. The sequence of the structure starts from present perfect tense, past perfect tense, and the future perfect tense. The topics provide conversation with the partner, creating the dialogues and modeling the conversation with classmates. And there are also four skills provided such as; listening, speaking, reading, and writing. And in the point (c), the grading and progressing of the textbooks are suitable for the learners. The materials provided in the textbooks are intended for eleventh grade students. And the materials can be applied in teaching learning.

Language content

There are points that are related to language content based on criteria of good textbook according Cunningsworth (1995). Those points are grammar item, vocabulary, and pronunciation work. In response to point (a), the grammar items are appropriate to each level and take students’ needs into account. They contain sentence structure to suggest and offer something, sentences structure to express opinions, sentence structure of cause and effect, and changes of pronouns from active voice to passive voice. The vocabulary, point (b), are suitable in terms of quantity and range vocabulary. Vocabulary used in materials, expression, invitation, letter, text, and song is easy for the learners to understand. Consequently, the students can work easily in the activity, practice of the expression, and dialogue writing, and performing the dialogue practice with their partners. For example materials for opinion involve phrases “in my opinion”, “I think”, “I agree with opinion” and “I disagree with you”. For point (c), the structuring and conventions on the material explanation for students are appropriate. The contents in each chapter are similar. For example in material about opinions and thoughts it begins with brainstorming about opinions, followed by explain about definition opinion, sentence structure to express opinion, kinds of expressions of opinion that can be used to show an agreement toward an opinion, and the last examples of opinions.
Skill

In the point (a), "Bahasa Inggris" (T1) has not fulfilled the suitability because the listening skills are less discussed than the other skills. Meanwhile, the T2 and T3 are suitable because they provide the four skills which are adequately covered.

Regarding point (b), the materials of the three textbooks are suitable with integrated skills because there are writing and speaking skills that can be learned through completing the dialogues then practice them in conversation. The learning style in every chapter is appropriate to the students’ levels that can make them easily to practice their newly acquired knowledge.

For point (c), the reading passage and activities are suitable for the students’ levels. The evidence is the textbook provides a global warming text in chapter 2 (see page 18). The students are motivated to discuss with their friends about the text.

As for point (d), which is related to the listening materials, the three textbooks are deemed suitable. It is because of the listening material being well-recorded, as authentic as possible, accompanied by background information, questions, and activities. However, listening section in textbooks is just listening of song. The listening skill is less discussed while the book covers more in reading and writing skill. This is different from the Pathway to English and Outcomes Upper Intermediate textbooks.

In the point (e), the materials for speaking from the three textbooks have fulfilled suitability. It can be seen that the dialogues and role plays are well-designed for students for the daily interaction or communication. In the last point, the materials of the textbooks related to the writing activities are suitable. The activities provide an analytical exposition regarding the recent issues in the media.

Topic

Topic is one of the determining aspects of good criteria by Cunningsworth (1995). The 2013 Curriculum is well known as a curriculum with rich topics in each subject. They are constructed in basic competences. This evaluation is done to find out how far this textbook conceptualizes the topics from the curriculum. Therefore, the researcher used these criteria that include in this aspect. They are about sufficient materials of genuine interest to learners, enough variety and range of topic, and whether the topic will help expand students’ awareness and enrich their experience.

The topics are sophisticated enough in content within the learners’ language level and the social and cultural contexts that are presented in the textbook. Textbook has a variety of tasks and topics as powerful factors to boost the learners’ motivation in learning process. Besides, the topics brought forward in the materials fulfill the students’ needs and are appropriate with the students’ real life.

Methodology

There are five sub-criteria that are included in this criterion. The criterion of methodology seeks to answer the questions of approach or approaches to language learning taken by the textbook and whether the approach is appropriate to the teaching learning situation, what level of active learner involvement can be expected, level of compatibility between the students’ learning styles and expectations, what techniques are used for presenting new language items and whether they are suitable for the learners, the different skills are be taught, and what communicative abilities are developed.

Teachers’ book

The criterion on teachers’ book seeks to answer whether there is adequate guidance for teachers who will be using the course book and its supporting materials, the teachers’ books are comprehensive and supportive, they adequately cover teaching techniques, language items such
as grammar rules and culture-specific information, keys to exercises are given, it provides ready-made materials, texts ideas for teaching exercises and tasks, textbook supports the teacher in two ways, and textbook provides teachable language models and exercise and tasks supporting the learning.

**Political consideration**

Political consideration seeks to answer the questions of how much the whole package costs and whether this represents good value for money, whether the books are strong and long-lasting, whether they are attractive in appearance, whether they are easy to obtain and further supplies can be obtained at short notice, and whether any parts of the package require particular equipment, such as a language laboratory, listening center, or video player and it is reliable.

**Conclusion**

There are two research problems in this study. The first problem is how three textbooks are used by the eleventh grade of Senior High School appropriate with criteria of good textbook based on Cunningsworth’s framework. Based on the research on evaluation of textbooks, the researcher presented the conclusion of the research. (1) *Bahasa Inggris* meets only five criterion of good textbook based on Cunningsworth’s theory, and they are aims and approaches, design and organization, topic, teachers’ book and political consideration. However, it fails to meet on criteria language content, skills, and methodology; (2) *Pathway to English* meet four criteria of good textbook by Cunningsworth. What it passes are aims and approaches, design and organization, teachers’ book and political consideration. What it fails to meet criteria are content, skills, topic, and methodology; (3) *Outcomes Upper Intermediate* meet five criteria of good textbook by Cunningsworth. Those are aims and approaches, design and organization, skills, topic, and teachers’ book. The rest fail to meet the mark.

**Strengths and weaknesses**

**Bahasa Inggris**

The following are the strengths and the weaknesses of the textbook “*Bahasa Inggris*” based on the data findings and discussion above. Two strengths were identified in this textbook: (1) This textbook is suitable with the students’ level and ages. It provides materials which suit the students’ needs and the difficulty level of the materials are sufficient; (2) The tasks are varied. They are to be done by the students in individual and group works.

The identified weaknesses of this textbook are: (1) The exercises provided in every unit put heavy loads on the students. This negatively affects students’ learning motivation; (2) The material is not up to date; (3) The tasks provided are not varied. There are basically of similar tasks for every unit; (4) This textbook is the most expensive compared to the other two books.

**Pathway to English**

The following are the strengths and the weaknesses of the textbook “*Pathway to English*” based on the data findings and the discussion above. There were three strengths found in this textbook, such as: (1) This textbook provides tasks in order to develop student language competence; (2) The task is interesting and varied. There are tasks requiring students to work in pair or individually. The weaknesses of this textbook such as: (1) This textbook does not have a teacher’s book; (2) There are a lot of tasks that have to be done by the students.

**Outcomes Upper Intermediate**

The following are the strengths and weaknesses of the textbook “*Outcomes Upper Intermediate*” based on data findings and the discussion above. There were strengths discovered in this textbook, such as: (1) This textbook is suitable to the students’ level and background
knowledge. It motivates and helps the students with their learning; (2) This textbook provides teacher’s book; (3) This textbook has various activities, the activities need to be performed by students as an individual or group work; (4) The pictures and texts used in this textbook are up to date. The weaknesses of this textbook such as This textbook did not clearly state a task which allows the students to learn about other culture.

References


