Integrated Versus Subordinated: Public Relations Application In Faith-Based Women Organization

Kholifatul Fauziyah*
Fakultas Agama Islam, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.
Jl. Brawijaya, Kasihan, Bantul, Yogyakarta, 55183
Email: kholifatul.fauziyah@umy.ac.id

**Abstrak**

This paper offers a critical interpretation of public relations (PR) generic principles application in faith-based women organization. In particular, this paper examines whether this organization should manage PR in separate management. This study takes up the PR application in Central Board of Aisyiyah (CBA) since it subordinated the PR function to a secretary in the administrative period on 2010 down to date, whereas it engaged with PR as a single department on 2005-2010. This subordination turns into vice versa application of the generic principle because if the significant contribution of PR considered, its application pattern should be run from subordinative, as a part of another department, into an integrative management function. Therefore, this paper elaborates the PR application in both periods and the factors working on it. The research method was a case study using the four models of PR, from Hunt and Grunig, as an analysis framework. The results indicate that there is no significant difference between the period of subordination and before. The factors influenced its applications are knowledge and skill, shared expectations, participative culture and organizational identity. Thus, the results have theoretical and practical implications for PR application in faith-based women organization.

**Info artikel**

**Article History**

Naskah diterima: 29 Juni 2020
Naskah direvisi: 5 Juli 2020
Naskah disetujui: 5 Juli 2020

**Kata kunci:**

Public Relations Application, The Four Models, Aisyiyah, Faith-Based Women Organization

**INTRODUCTION**

In the history of women's movement in Indonesia, 'Aisyiyah who was born in 1917 has a very special position (Darban, 2010). At least, there are three main things related to 'Aisyiyah, namely the oldest, largest and innovative. With the age of 102 years in 2019, 'Aisyiyah is the oldest faith-based women organization in Indonesia that still exists today. It was among the pioneering organizations of the Indonesian Women's Congress on December 22-25, 1928 which is now KOWANI (Kongres Wanita Indonesia) in Yogyakarta. In its journey, of the 30 women's associations that participated in the first Indonesian women's congress, only 3 were still active today. They are Wanita Katolik (founded in 1924), Wanita Taman Siswa (founded in 1922) and 'Aisyiyah. Of the three, ‘Aisyiyah holds the highest level of success when viewed from its role and social performance (Putra, 2012). Wanita Taman Siswa is still active but only engaged in education. Wanita Katolik is also still standing and engaged in social and educational fields. Hence, 'Aisyiyah as the eldest of the three organizations, has now expanded its social work, not only in the fields of education and social religion but also health, economy, culture, family development to the environment.

From the side of quantity and quality of business charity, ‘Aisyiyah is the largest faith-based women organization in Indonesia. This organization has 244 charity businesses in the health sector including public hospitals to the Prosperous Family Service Centers, 13 high schools and universities, 23,772 primary and secondary education, 185 child social welfare
institutions, 568 cooperatives, 1,426 units of Family Economy Business, as well as developing the’ Aisyiyah Entrepreneurship School and Legal Aid Post in various regions in Indonesia (aisyiyah.or.id).

Besides, ‘Aisyiyah is famous for its innovative movements in various aspects of life. Even in the management structure of the Leadership Support Agency at the central level, 'Aisyiyah dared to change the assemblies nomenclature and institutions in response to challenges and obstacles faced. For example, in the period 2010-2015 and 2015-2020, the Central Board of ‘Aisyiyah (CBA) has a Law and Human Rights Assembly. In the period 2005-2010, the unit was named the Institute of External Organization, Law and Advocacy. The writing of the auxiliary bodies in the form of assemblies and institutions has its own consequences. In Article 19 of the Articles of Association, it stated that the assembly is the auxiliary body of the leader who carries out some of the main tasks of the organization. Whereas the institute is a leadership assistance agency that carries out the supporting tasks of the organization. Thus, the law and human rights sector has developed from what was initially considered an organizational support task to be part of the main tasks that the organization must work on.

Interestingly, in the 47th of Muktamar in Makassar, CBA reported that the Institute of Public Relations and Publication (IPRP) that previously existed in the 2005-2010 period was abolished. The public relations tasks were moved under secretary duties. That means, after having experience with a public relations management unit within one period, CBA removes the institution and subordinates its tasks to other management functions, in 2010-2015 and 2015-2020 (aisyiyah.or.id). In fact, during the period of birth and development, IPRP is in the shade of the term Institute which refers to a unit in charge of some supporting tasks and not the main tasks.

This subordination emplaced ‘Aisyiyah public relations application into new and rarely issue which is interesting to be explored. In fact, at practical level, the PR subordination by ‘Aisyiyah has become the PR application that is difficult to find in common with other organizations, especially at the level of faith-based women organizations in Indonesia. In a country inhabited by the most Muslims in the world, the term public relations is still relatively new to these organizations. Based on the observations on various structures of faith-based women organizations who are members of Kongres Wanita Indonesia (KOWANI), only Wanita Islam and ‘Aisyiyah who have a single department namely Public Relations in the range year of 2005-2010 at the national level. Therefore, ‘Aisyiyah was chosen to represent PR of faith-based women organization in Indonesia because in this domain, only this organization applied public relations on a national scale at the central level with two pattern of application, integrated and subordinated.

An integrative PR application refers to the PR application when it is in a special management function that is separate from other management functions but still has a direct relationship with the top executive. This is consistent with one of the principles in the generic principles of public relations in which Grunig et al said that public relations should be managed by a separate management function that has direct access to the top executives (Rhee, 2004, Grunig, 2009). These principles can be applied globally and should be practiced locally (Grunig, 2009). The generic principle is a formula for how PR must be applied so that it can play an optimal role in creating an effective organization. Whereas subordinate PR applications refer to PR applications where their functions are deemed necessary but are placed as part of other management functions.

Some important things highlight this CBA PR application. From the organizational structure, this PR subordination occurred at the top leadership level. The top leaders should have the most complete composition structure in organization. Consequently, this subordination will influence the composition of structure at the regional, district, branch and village levels. In terms of time, the decision to subordinate the functions of the PR into secretary happened when ‘Aisyiyah would climb its first century. This one century span indicate a lot of variety of communication relations need to be built with various stakeholders.

Several scholars have reviewed public relations in non-profit organizations and women organizations (Bortree & Waters, 2010; Jeavons, 2004; Lane, 2003; Onsongo, Mberia, & Jjuuko, 2017; Park & Rhee, 2010; Taliaferro & Ruggiano, 2010; Waters, 2007). Some scholar
studies also specifically examine the themes of women and public relations and even the values of feminists in public relations (L. A. Grunig, Toth, & Hon, 2000; Krugler, n.d.). Some studies show the significance of the role of faith-based organizations in community development and public health (Chowdhury, Wahab, & Islam, 2018). Even so, there has not been much analysis of the generic principles application of public relations in women organizations, especially in the area of integrated versus subordinative management function.

There is a need to analyze public relations application in the both period of integrative and subordinative to provide new understanding for scholars and practitioners about the dynamics of PR that occur in the field. The factors that influence this application also need to be explored to gain new understanding related to the PR implementation in the tract.

This study tried to answer the challenge by offering a critical interpretation of PR generic principles application in this organization and factors work on it. It will provide a major contribution to fostering PR studies in Indonesia, especially in domains that have been less explored. Therefore, it has a theoretical contribution to portray the status of public relations throughout the world. In this case, the result will enrich global public relations practice from the perspective of public relations practitioners in Indonesia. From practical aspect, this study will review the format of integrated management function application of PR in the context of faith-based women organization. The result also intended to propose the PR model at the related domain. Hence, the PR practitioner will get more notions in construct the PR application of their field.

Based on the discussion above, the research objectives will be directed by these questions:

RQ 1: How are public relations implemented when 'Aisiyah still has PR institution as a separated management function?
RQ 2: How are public relations implemented when 'Aisyiyah subordinates its public relations function?
RQ 3: What factors influence the application?

Since the model is a typology that represents something, this study uses The Hunt Grunig Model with its various dimensions to get an overview of the application of CBA public relations before and after subordination. In this context, theories about public relations models provide an analytical framework that can be used to describe the application of public relations in organizations (J. E. Grunig, 2006; J. E. Grunig & Grunig, 2008; Laskin, 2009; Rhee, 2004). Besides, a review of the factors influences public relations is adopted from the ideal PR variables from Dozier et al and Grunig and Grunig. These variables are chosen because both contain elements that are able to explain why an institution applies public relations with certain models. In addition, this study is also open to other variables which are found in the field.

The Four Models

The Hunt Grunig Model (The Four Models) is a middle-range theory rooted in the excellence theory. According to Grunig (2006), excellence theory is a grand theory of the overall value of the PR function of the organization. Although it does not explain all matters related to PR, this theory provides a comprehensive analysis framework to describe various aspects of PR both positive and normative. Laskin (2009) called it the dominant theoretical perspective in PR research. Therefore, the perspective of the PR application model in this study is also based on the excellence theory which states that the ideal PR is two-way symmetrical.

The PR model initiated by Hunt and Grunig categorizes PR applications into 4 models, namely press agentry, public information, two-way asymmetrical, and two-way symmetrical. The press agentry model is a typology oriented towards achieving good publicity from the press. This model is often referred to as PR-like activities. The public information model is a typology that seeks to provide trusted information for public. While the two-way asymmetric model is a typology oriented towards efforts to realize organizational goals through public persuasion. Finally, a two-way symmetrical model is a typology that seeks to gain a two-way understanding with the public while simultaneously achieving a balanced communication effect. The Hunt-Grunig model categorization is based on the direction (two way or one way) and the balance of
the intended communication effect (symmetrical or asymmetrical) (See Rhee, 2004 and Laskin, 2009).

Asymmetric PR indicators are contending, avoiding, accommodating and compromising (See Hon & Grunig, 1999). Contending is an organization's activity to convince the public to be willing to accept an organizational position. Avoiding is an organizational effort in avoiding conflict with the public, both psychic and physical. Accommodating is an organizational activity in hearing public aspirations. While compromising is an attempt to compromise the organization with the public on various matters by remaining in the desired position. Thus, the results of the compromise do not necessarily benefit all parties.

The symmetrical indicators are cooperating, being unconditionally constructive, and saying win-win solution or no deal (Hon & Grunig, 1999). Cooperating refers to efforts to collaborate with the public to create mutually beneficial relationships. Being unconditionally constructive refers to the activities of an organization in providing the best for the public, even though it must give up its position or not get an equal response. Saying win-win solution or no deal is the activities of the organization and the public to agree on mutual decisions for both parties. In this case, both parties can jointly agree to disagree. Willingness to share this disagreement is part of symmetrical communication because it shows that both parties realize the potential to mutually agree on decisions that benefit both of them in the future.

I tried to investigate the asymmetrical and symmetrical indicators above from public relations program goals, organizational response to public opinion and public involvement in policy setting. In addition, related to ethical aspects, I assume that each institution has different conditions or environments. Hence, public aspirations are also not always true even though listening to them will show the impression of aspirational public relations. Therefore, the model that describes the application of public relations in an organization cannot be punished wrong or correct in absolute terms without elaborating how, and why public relations of an organization carries out its PR activities in certain typology.

Grunig then proposed a model called the new model of excellent two way public relations. This model is between the two continuum asmetris. This model was proposed to clarify the symmetrical meaning of the term Grunig proposed but was often misinterpreted by some scholars. It is not surprising that the main principles of symmetrical models are still the main reference (J. Grunig, 2001; Lane, 2003).

Dimensions of Public Relations Application

The PR dimension here refers to what scale can be measured to classify its application in an organization. Some Grunig students like Huang, Rhee and Sha try to provide solutions regarding what dimensions can be measured to describe the application of public relations in organizations. Finally, Grunig, et al provide 7 new dimensions or scales namely One-way, Two-way, Asymmetrical, Symmetrical, Interpersonal, Mediated and Ethical (Laskin, 2009).

The seven dimensions can be simplified into 4 dimensions. These dimensions are the direction of communication consisting of one-way and two-way, the effects of communication that include asymmetrical and symmetrical, forms of communication that include interpersonal and mediated, and ethical dimensions. Without changing the substance of the seven dimensions above, this study uses the simplification.

Furthermore, Larissa Grunig et al applied these dimensions to categorize The Hunt Grunig Model as a public relations application typology of an organization (Petersone, 2004). The press agency model contains asymmetric, one-way and unethical dimensions and uses mediated forms of communication. The public information model contains asymmetric dimensions, one-way, use mediated forms of communication more than interpersonal, but tends to prioritize ethics rather than the press agency model. While the two-way asymmetric model contains two-way dimensions and asymmetrical communication balance. Besides, it can be practiced ethically or not, and can run two forms of communication both interpersonal and mediated. The two-way symmetrical model consists of symmetrical, two-way, and ethical dimensions. The form of communication in this model can be run in a mediated or interpersonal form. Nevertheless, the interpersonal approach gets significant attention. Thus, this study uses
The Hunt Grunig Model which has been equipped with various dimensions as an analysis framework for CBA PR application.

**Factors Affecting Public Relations Implementation**

Dozier et al. stated that the ideal public relations (excellence) consist of 3 complementary things, namely knowledge and skill, shared expectation and participative culture (Laskin, 2009). Knowledge and skill are the core of ideal public relations in which the public relations department must have sufficient knowledge to conduct two-way communication with the public, conduct research and understand social science in the context of the communication it carries. The shared expectation is that both top managers and PR departments have the same perspective in assessing PR. Thus, both parties not only view public relations as an officer who publishes press releases or welcomes guests to organizational protocols, but also as a part that handles the management of communication between organizations and key audiences. While participative culture means that the work environment of the organization has a culture of conducive cooperation. Dozier et al. also added that in fact, the organization “that value team work, widely involve employees in decision making, and are open to ideas of outside the organization are more likely to have excellent programs.” (Laskin, 2009). I argue that the three things that determine the ideal or not of public relations can be variables of analysis to identify why an organization applies PR with a particular model.

While proposing 2 ideal PR variables, the direction and purpose or effect of communication, which are then poured in the four PR models above, J. Grunig and L. Grunig also propose 3 other variables that can be analytical variables why an organization applies a particular PR model. The three things are organizational culture, the potential of PR departments and PR schemes (Petersone, 2004).

Organizational culture consists of values, symbols, meanings, assumptions, beliefs, and hopes that unite a group of people who work together. These cultures influence the determination of organizational policies, including decisions related to the application of PR models. Inherently, organizations that implement closed system management tend to apply asymmetrical dimensions. Conversely, organizations with management that practice open management systems tend to apply symmetrical dimensions. Organizational culture is on the authoritarian to the participatory continuum.

The second factor is the potential of the PR department which includes knowledge of PR practitioners, especially regarding the two-way model. If PR practitioners have the knowledge and skills related to the excellence model of PR, then the organization concerned also tends to implement two-way symmetrical. Besides, the greater the potential of the PR department, the greater the possibility for senior practitioners to join in the organization's top decision-making circle.

The third factor is a PR scheme that includes the PR understanding and skills of senior managers. This depends on two things. First, PR practitioners who have PR knowledge and skills are involved in the top managerial coalition and facilitate the understanding of top managers related to PR. Second, top managers educate themselves about PR. Here, I tend to use terms from Dozier et al. without ignoring the substance of the factors that influence the application of public relations from Grunig above.

**RESEARCH METHOD**

One of this research aim was to restructure and expand the generic principle of PR by elaborating how they applied in some specific and actual context. To fulfill the purpose, case study design was used since the research questions arise from theories review could be considered as a case study instrument. Whereas the design of a single case study was chosen because the PR subordination at CBA has both longitudinal, rarely encountered, and unique elements. Moreover, the subordination of the public relations function to the secretary is a single and unique case.

There are three criteria used to assess the quality of the case study design: construct validity, external validity and reliability. The construct validity is done using triangulation method or using more than one data collection technique. While external validity is applied...
using the theory of The Hunt Grunig Model and ideal PR variables from Dozier et al. The reliability is enforced by using a case study protocol that contains a sequence or schedule of research when collecting data.

**Determination of Informants**

The evidences of findings arise from the qualitative interviews with the representative of organization policy maker to those who have the initiative to design and run PR. The informants were selected based on pre-observation related to those who knew and directly supervised the pre and post PR subordination policies. In this case, the willingness of the informants concerned as well as permission from CBA is a separate consideration in selecting and sorting out the informants. The following is a list of the main informants:

**Table 1 Data of Informants**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Initials of Informant</th>
<th>Position at 'Aisyiyah</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Top Chairwoman of CBA 2005 - 2010 and chairwoman of CBA 2010-2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Head of Assembly of kader development 2005 - 2010 and chairwoman of CBA 2010-2015 and 2015-2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Member of Board of Public Relations and Publications of CBA 2005-2010 and editorial staff of Suara 'Aisyiyah 2015-2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Member of Board of Public Relations and Publications 2005-2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Staf of Institute of Research and Development of CBA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Data Collection and Analysis Techniques**

This study uses semi-structured interviews to collect primary data. This type of interview was used because I try to have data about the PR application of CBA that can be encoded as well as open to other additional information in response to the answers of the informants. Secondary data is obtained through the observation and documentation process. While the observations made are indirect observations because the type of situation observed is not entirely historical so I can focus on specific situations related to information about the PR application.

Meanwhile, documentation was carried out on various CBA documents related to the object of research, both public and private. These documents are the biography or curriculum vitae of the informants, the structure of the CBA management for the period 2005-2010, 2010-2015 and 2015-2020, the history of the organization ‘Aisyiyah, the decisions of the CBA II - V Plenary Meeting for the period 2010 - 2015 which contains the subordination of PR functions, telephone book of CBA public members, CBA work program for the period of 2005-2010 and 2010-2015, IPRP accountability report at the 46th Congress at 2010 and autonomous organization report of Central Board of Muhammadiyah in the 47th congress at 2015. In addition, the documentation process is also carried out in several news releases and printed materials of organization such as brochures or leaflets.

All data collection techniques are carried out in two stages. The first stage was done in 2014 as the first administrative period of subordination. The second stage is carried out in 2019.
when PR subordination still exist until two administrative periods. Data collection carried out by adjusting the possibility of interviews with the informants as well as access to the process of observation and related documentation. The analysis technique used in this case study research is relying on theoretical proposition of The Hunt Grunig Model with various dimensions whose data obtained entered to certain categories according to their pattern similarity to the theory referred to and then interpreted and concluded. In detail, the stages of processing data analysis consist of editing, coding, data tabulation, interpretation and conclusions.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

To meet the research objectives, the findings will be sorted from the PR application when it is still run integratively. Then, I will conclude the CBA PR application model. Afterwards, I will elaborate on the findings of subordinate PR applications in the period 2010-2015 and 2015 until now. The findings of the PR application in the period 2010-2015 and 2015 up to now should show whether the different forms of PR applications are also in line with the differences in the PR application model that is run along with all its dimensions. After that, the theoretical and practical implications of these findings will be presented.

Integrated PR Application

The PR application in this period will be analyzed through four dimensions of PR application model.

Dimension of Communication Direction

The indicators used to assess this dimension are relations with the public, communication activities and management of public relations program.

Relations with the Public

Points of relations with the public have been considered as important organizational activities by the CBA. Even though on the practical side there is still a lot of publications activities, at the management level there is a willingness to hear public opinion and understanding that PR have a function to conduct two-way communication with the public.

A said:

Public of ‘Aisyiyah separated from top to bottom. People say ‘Aisyiyah is a branch that is below. Well, yes, but also the one above. Because the one above, if he speaks, his speech will be heard by the masses.

C said:

The point is the publication of CBA activities to the public. Hmm ... to be honest, we still haven't reached the stage of understanding public thoughts about us. We have just arrived at the stage of delivering our activities to the public.

In the national PR program elaboration document also shows one-way communication. Research to find out the public response to the organization, according to Twediana, has also not been done.

Communication Activities

CBA communication activities are mostly at the level of publication, information delivery, and imaging. Publication and dissemination of information are reflected in the dissemination of information through the website and manufacture of printed materials that represent the organization and its activities.

C said:
It seems that the activities were making leaflets, company profile, Suara ‘Aisyiyah, reporting of ‘Aisyiyah activities, making a website, supporting reporting of large CBA events such as Tanwir and Muktamar.

The imaging aspect is reflected in PR selected organizational information at their leadership level. The regional leadership is also expected to be a supporter of the IPRP news sources in accordance with ‘Aisyiyah imaging standardization that has been socialized.

D said:

That’s part of syiar too. Islam as rahmatan lil ‘alamin, we have done. The hope is that there will be people who follow... One of the public relations criteria is imaging too. Whether you want it or not, what we deliver should be the good one. Imaging is important.

The CBA communication activities show a tendency for communication activities that are still dominated by the one-way monologue from the organization to the public. Nevertheless, two-way communication was also carried out. The two-way communication indicator in the form of trying to understand the public (see Sha, 2007) manifested by CBA in the form of raising cooperation with stakeholders both by maintaining existing cooperation and adding cooperation networks that have not been developed.

In the IPRP website archive, it is stated that this institution is a management function that communicates all activities, programs and organizational policies to related parties, both internal and external, and forms a positive image of ‘Aisyiyah to public. For this reason, the focus of the programs is the publication and dissemination of programs and activities including ‘Aisyiyah leaders’ opinion, ‘Aisyiyah positive image socialization and raising and maintaining cooperation with stakeholders.

Meanwhile, the public relations program targets written in the national PR program elaboration document are as follows:
1. Increased understanding of the role of PR and publishing institutions in organizations.
2. Availability of CBA activities agenda.
3. Availability of information about CBA for organization internal/external stakeholders.
4. Dissemination of ‘Aisyiyah activities publication at regional/national/international level.
5. Dissemination of ‘Aisyiyah opinion about current problems.
6. Increase ‘Aisyiyah publication both at the national/international level
7. Compiled and socialized PR guidebooks.
8. Increased PR ability of Regional Boards of ‘Aisyiyah.
9. Determination of new format of Suara ‘Aisyiyah
10. Increased imaging ‘Aisyiyah.
11. Maintain existing cooperation.
12. Add network collaboration.

The two documents show that relationship management by maintaining relationships that have been built and increasing networking with stakeholders is included in the objectives of the IPRP programs. In the national program elaboration document, it was stated that guarding the existing cooperation was carried out by sending Lebaran cards, leaflets and Suara ‘Aisyiyah magazines. While the strategy to increase networking is done by browsing on the internet.

Public Relations Program Management

Implementation of CBA PR programs consists of planning, institutional meetings, implementation of activities and evaluation. At the highest level, the evaluation of activities at the top level is carried out at the highest forum called the Muktamar. In general, CBA has a
monitoring and evaluation mechanism which is the responsibility of the leadership above both incidentally and periodically. Thus, the CBA has carried out planning before carrying out activities and has a guide to the steps of the activity including monitoring and evaluation which are regulated in the organization's Articles of Association and By-laws. Overall, the PR programs management still has not included research to conduct a two-way PR program between organizations and the public to achieve mutual goals. Hence, it can be concluded that the CBA PR application is more inclined to one-way continuum than two-way.

Dimensions of Communication Effects
This dimension is analyzed from the PR programs objectives of the, the organization's response to public opinion and the possibility of public involvement in policymaking. In the interview conducted by three informants, it shows that CBA applied asymmetric communication when dealing with the public. Meanwhile, another informant mentioned information that CBA applied asymmetric and symmetrical communication. Nonetheless, the tendency of the asymmetrical portion remains larger.

Public Relations Program Objectives
The communication objectives indicators show that CBA PR programs contain communication objectives, most of which have asymmetrical effects. These goals are publication, information dissemination, imaging and raising cooperation with stakeholders. These objectives relate to the press agency model, public information and two-way asymmetry. The organizations that implement two-way symmetrical communicate with the public to understand them not for persuasion purposes but to facilitate understanding between the organization and the public. In CBA, even though the discourse is already there, it is only practically realized in an effort to maintain cooperation with the public and establish a new network of cooperation.

The findings above were reinforced by the statement of D who mentioning that public relations activities are more about activities related to the media. She said, "... The most routine ones are press releases, reporting the news, including establishing communication with the media."

Organizational Response to Public Opinion
At CBA, public opinion can change the way or method of the organization in carrying out its activities. However, these changes are still within the framework so that organizational goals can be accepted by the public. Because there is no clear public definition, in general, the public is always positioned as the object of communication. This can be seen from the Twediana statement above explicitly stated that IPRP has not reached the stage of understanding feedback yet from the public to the organization.

Whereas B provides information that as an organization that works in many sectors, 'Aisyiyah has many relationships with various publics. With its social service activities, public can accept the existence of 'Aisyiyah. Resistance from external public organizations tends to be at the level of discourse.. Examples of discourses that are sensitive to the resistance of some public components are the concept of a sakinah family which emphasizes monogamy and other women sensitive issues. In facing this public resistance, 'Aisyiyah did not take the frontal path. An example of the strategy used in dealing with resistance is to write a book related to the issue.

Moreover, A said that organizations can change their attitudes and behavior because of factors that come from changes in the context or situation in society. For example, the organization changed its da'wah method to be more strategic in reaching out to the community. So, what changes from the organization is only the method or the way to move.

The research findings highlight that in response to public opinion, CBA tends to choose a non-frontal path. Public opinion may change the way in program implementation but not with the essence of the program. This shows that the intended communication effect is still asymmetrical.

Hon and Grunig (1999) and Rhee (2004) state that asymmetrical indicators are contending (convince the public to accept organizational positions), avoiding (avoid conflict
with the public, both psychological and physical), accommodating (hear public aspirations) and compromising (compromise with the public on various matters, but by staying in the position it wants). The CBA's response to the public is in accordance with the asymmetrical indicators, specifically contending, accommodating and compromising.

Public Engagement in Policymaking

While it is related to public involvement in policymaking, communication by CBA is also on an asymmetrical continuum. Even though PR is involved in top executives meetings to find out about the public, it still leads to the goal so that organizational policies can be accepted by the public. A said that the public was involved when the CBA management would establish a policy. Therefore, she suggested that PR representatives participate in top executives meetings so they could provide insight into what was happening and what should be communicated to the public. Nevertheless, the IPRP has not reached the stage of optimally listening to public aspirations yet.

Thus, pattern matching of CBA communication effects with communication goal indicators in the form of program objectives, organizational response to public opinion, and public involvement in policymaking shows that PR communication tends to be in the asymmetrical dimension. This dimension is contained in the model of press agentry, public information and two-way asymmetrical. Meanwhile, the symmetrical dimensions are contained in a two-way symmetrical model. As for symmetrical dimensions, it is also applied, but only when CBA collaborates with external parties. Hence, the dimension of the communication effect highlights that the two-way symmetrical model is a non-dominant model used.

Dimensions of the Form of Communication

‘Aisyiyah uses mediated communication and interpersonal communication. The indicator used is an analysis of communication strategies both face to face and through the media. The analysis shows that mediated communication tends to be more dominant to use.

According to Laskin (2009), in general, interpersonal is a communication method that is more widely used by PR with a two-way communication model. While the mediated communication dimension is more likely to whom apply a one-way communication model. Grunig, et al. mentioned that the model consisting of dimensions of asymmetrical, one-way dimensions, tended to use more forms of mediated communication than interpersonal communication was a public information model (Petersone, 2004). Meanwhile, the press agentry model tends to only use mediated communication. While the two-way asymmetrical and two-way symmetrical models use mediated and interpersonal communication on the mid continuum and tend to be more interpersonal.

The analysis shows that mediated communication tends to be more dominant to use. The results are based on informant D information that the most frequent IPRP activity is the issuance of press releases. C also explained that technically, contact with the public was carried out through the press conference, sending news releases to the media and the CBA website. The strategy was chosen because the focus was indeed still on increasing the publication of activities to the general public. Even so, it does not rule out the possibility to contact public members personally. Regarding activities, for example, the IPRP will contact the person in charge of their activities.

CBA also has a telephone book list that contains telephone numbers of public members. Whereas contact via telephone alone can be done in the office using the telephone book list or directly from the cellphone of each of the leaders, members, and IPRP technical staff. Although IPRP employs technical staff who are in charge of managing IPRP communication techniques such as documentation, there are no special officers in charge of making telephone contact. Moreover, the organization also complements telephone facilities with facsimile.

In addition, IPRP also publishes printed materials such as leaflets and booklets that describe the organization profile. It also publishes the Suara ‘Aisyiyah Magazine in English once a year and a book that contains an initial review of ‘Aisyiyah history and the Indonesian women’s movement.
Dimension of Ethic

The indicators to analyze ethical dimensions are the nature of information and the practice of the code of ethics. Data collected from the three informants show that the nature of the information conveyed by CBA is semi-open and does not adopt the PR code of ethics. However, the organization respects ethical principles in communicating with the public.

Regarding this semi-open nature of information, informant D conveyed:
... One of the PR criteria is imaging too. Like it or not, what is delivered is also good, right? Imaging is important. The problem only is the problem needs or not to be delivered. There are good things that we don't need to say or not. For example, this is too ... too, internal in nature or for example too,, there is a secret or for example regarding the dignity of the organization or discrediting others, it is also unnecessary. 

Although not adopting a certain PR code of ethics, A mentioned:
The code of ethics still exists there. Therefore, PR can run smoothly if we pay attention to the code of ethics. And the existence of the code of ethics shows something that must be considered in its PR work.

As part of ‘Aisyiyah, IPRP has an organizational guide that respects ethical principles and is in accordance with its character as a faith-based women organization. Characterization of some actors is also an important element in which IPRP members who have a PR professional background are sources for sorting out PR activities which are permissible and not permissible.

CBA Public Relations Application Model Category

The study of CBA PR application in the four dimensions above shows that IPRP is more likely to be in the continuum of one-way, asymmetrical, mediated, and ethical communication in accordance with its character as a faith-based women organization. Then, it can be concluded that the public information model is a dominant model of CBA PR application. While the press agentry and two-way asymmetrical models are at the medium level. The two-way symmetrical model is the model of CBA public relations which is the least frequently displayed because it only appears in absolute terms on one dimension of respect for ethics.

The categorization of the PR implementation model can be examined in the following figure:

**Figure 1: Frequency of CBA Public Relations Dimensions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Communication Direction</th>
<th>Communication Effect</th>
<th>Communication Form</th>
<th>Ethic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Press Agentry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Information</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Way Asymmetry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Way Symmetry</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subordinated PR Application (2010-2015)

Based on the data collected, I found no significant difference in the application of PR dimensions. Some of the following are important things to look at related to the implementation of CBA PR pre and post-subordination:

1. PR product reproduction phase. There are no significant developments in the application of public relations in the 2010-2015 period. PR products such as leaflets and booklets are still the same. That is, this period only reproduces the existing ones. In
some cases, as stated by D, some PR activities that were previously carried out by IPRP became less than optimal. For example news releases become irregular and website management is handled by the Research and Development Institute that less in reporting organization activities routinely.

2. Program management of PR does not develop optimally. There is no document that outlines a special mechanism compiled about how the secretary must carry out this PR activities. In fact, in the IPRP period 2005-2010, the translation of the national PR program was made at the beginning of the period.

3. The subordination period is the period of transition of PR. This was stated by A. According to her, IPRP was subordinated due to technical reasons. The chairwoman passed away and the members had gone everywhere, both in the sense that they had entered another institution or were no longer at CBA because they studied abroad. So it is more due to the lack of existing human resources. She acknowledged that with the current conditions, the application of PR became less effective. However, the substance of public relations remains as stated in the Plenary II decision for the period 2010-2015.

4. The absence of differences in concepts and types of products produced shows that the pre and post CBA PR subordination model also did not experience significant differences.


In this period, I found the following findings:

1. The unfinished PR transition. In 2014, when interviewed, A stressed that this PR subordination was not an ideal condition. She called it a transition period. In the 2015-2020 period, the PR Institution remained in its subordinate status. Whereas in terms of facilities and infrastructure, CBA shows significant progress. This can be seen from the construction of a new CBA building and the restoration of Suara ‘Aisyiyah office. Nevertheless, PR activities are more likely to be reproduction of previous publication activities. The PR subordination stage did not show any significant progress substantively. In fact, the PR subordination condition is like being at the level of stagnation because the expectation of the emergence of PR as a part that is seriously realized as a support for the vital function of the organization is getting depleted. The implication is that the application of PR from a strategic management perspective as Grunig suggested still seems to have a long way to be implemented.

2. The form of mediated communication that is being carried out is increasingly developing. In 2010, I searched the websites of Indonesian faith-based women organizations in KOWANI and found that less than a third of the organizations had their own official websites. Some who have official websites are ‘Aisyiyah. Interestingly, the development of today’s new media apparently also brought the development of mediated communication carried out by CBA. Not only websites and Facebook, but CBA also has an official account on several other social media. In fact, CBA also organizes online recitations. As Grunig (2009) said, the digitalization brings a wider expectation to conduct a more two-way and interpersonal communication with public as long as it do not practiced in an old way.

Factors Affecting Public Relations Application

As discussed above, the PR application in CBA is dominated by public information models. Several factors influence the dominance of this implementation.

Public Relations Knowledge and Skills

In 2005-2010, only one of the six leaders and members of the IPRP had a formal education background in Communication Studies with a concentration of study in media studies and in charge of PR practitioner at the university where she worked. As for the period of 2010-2015,
till follows, the general secretary and secretary are coming from non-Communication background.

One of the differences in the concentration of formal and professional education is reflected in the CBA PR goals, which are more one-way and asymmetrical with communication activities that are more dominant in publication, information delivery, and imaging. Public involvement is more at the contending stage.

The findings of this study are in line with what is called Dozier et al with knowledge as the core of ideal PR in which the PR department must have sufficient knowledge to conduct two-way communication with the public, and conduct research and understand social science in the context of the communication it carries. This is also in accordance with the excellence PR variable proposed by Grunig and Grunig as a potential PR department and PR scheme. The lackness of knowledge and skill has the potential to apply PR asymmetrically in one-way direction.

Shared Expectation

In CBA, at the top executive and at the institutional level, there are differences in how to effectively implement PR. Chamamah considers that in order to be effective, PR needs to be institutionalized specifically at the management level and not subordinated in other parts. While informant B stated that because the main essence lies in its task, the integrative or subordinative PR position in an organization become insignificant as long as the PR tasks can work. Similar to D, B said that the PR institution is not a must as long as there is a special team that manages it.

This difference in the perspective of effective application of PR has the potential to distance the application from the 1O PR generic principles put forward by Grunig et al, especially at the point of placing PR in strategic management positions and not subordinating them to other management function. The implication is that the application of symmetrical two-way communication is increasingly not dominant.

Participative Culture

Participative culture means that the work environment of the organization has a culture of conducive cooperation. The indicators of participatory culture observed in this study include organizational culture and attitudes towards non-organizational views. Related to this, there are indications of organizational culture that is not yet conducive to PR application. Some of them are leadership support and alertness of some employees who have not been optimal. Existing bureaucracy can make it easier while inhibiting the application of PR. Nonetheless, the Organization's Articles of Association and Bylaws show that the nuances of collective deliberation are so thick in this organization. While from the attitude of the CBA towards non-organizational views it can be concluded that in general CBA tends to be soft in the face of emerging public resistance. As for specifically, CBA public relations has not yet reached the stage of understanding public thought.

When looking at the understanding of public opinion that has not been carried out by CBA public relations, it can be concluded that this point makes the PR application tend to be one-way and asymmetrical. The involvement of office employees in the PR performance mechanism has not yet received maximum attention, so that the performance of PR, especially on the technical side of communication that cannot be separated from the administrative side of the CBA office has become constrained.

‘Aisyiyah Identity as a Faith-Based Women Organization

Identity as a faith-based women organization that does not seek profit in its activities and is bound to religious principles and social service-based brought ‘Aisyiyah activities to be inherently ethical. These include the implementation of PR programs and activities. The ethical dimension contains the provision that public relations decisions and policies carried out by
organizations must be in accordance with universal norms and obligations (Bowen, 2004). Although not adopting the PR Code of Ethics, CBA's commitment to only convey correct information makes its application tend to be into public information model rather than the press agentry. This ethical side also become one of the two-way symmetrical elements, although it later became the model that is rarely applied.

Besides, the socio-religious character also binds 'Aisyiyah to face public resistance softly because this character encourages organizations to be responsible for supporting public interests based on their belief in a particular religion. (See the character of non-profit organizations in (Boyer, 1997; Park & Rhee, 2010; Tkalac & Pavicic, 2003). This character, especially from the faith-based side also explains one of the asymmetrical CBA attitudes in which the absorption of public opinion is more intended to change the method of policy implementation and not its essence.

**Implications for PR Theory and Practice**

Integrated versus Subordinated

Debates about whether PR should be integrated into a certain department called PR that are directly connected with top executives or subordinated to other parts do need to be tested directly through applications in the field. In the case of CBA, the birth of PR as a separate management function has a significant positive effect. More than just the consistency of publications through the media, IPRP also formulate a national PR program that seeks to strengthen PR functions at the regional board level. At the practical level, IPRP hold PR training to representatives of the regional leaders.

After the IPRP was subordinated, efforts to strengthen the PR function at a level below the central board did not develop significantly. In 2015-2020, CBA did have a Media Team in charge of managing the form of mediated communication through new media. However, the existence of this team is more seen as a communication technician than a communication manager. The implication is that the influence of this team could bring PR functions cannot run optimally as a vital part of an organization. Also, as a communication technician, this team does not have significant influences in deciding organizational policies relating to the public.

Based on the application, I see that the integrated form of PR has more advantages than subordinated forms. This finding is theoretically the evidence for the generic principle of PR (Rhee, 2004). Practically, in the context of faith-based women organizations whose managers work voluntarily, this is indeed not an easy matter. Therefore, a more optimal regeneration process is needed to capture communication managers or planners so that they can be incorporated in the top executive organizations and become drivers of the communication technicians employed.

Organizations Identity Spark New Models

Some of the interviews, especially with informant A and D, show that although publication is one of the main objectives of PR programs, ‘Aisyiyah adheres to ethics so it only conveys information that is correct and does not exaggerate. In fact, the general tendency of profit institutions to focus on publications is to exaggerate themselves. A PR activity that is often referred to as PR-like activities.

Hence, I highlight that the character of ’Aisyiyah as a socio-religious organization who does not seek profit emplaced 'Aisyiyah activities to be inherently ethical. These include the implementation of PR programs. Also, this character binds to be soft when dealing with public resistance. This character, especially from the faith-based side, also explains one of the asymmetrical CBA attitudes in which the absorption of public opinion is more intended to change the method or how to implement organizational policy, not the essence of the organization's policies.

In terms of relations with the public, organizations with religious identities such as ‘Aisyiyah actually have large capital to gain public trust (Soukamneuth & Harvey, 2006). This is reflected in Doyle's writing, “People trust them. They may not always feel that sense community, acceptance, or automatic trust through other social services organizations.” Besides, the basis of trust influences the effectiveness of the performance of faith-based
organizations because it encourages the organizations concerned to use a holistic, sincere, and personal approach in relating to the public. This approach is a unique approach and may be lacking in non-religious social organizations (Noyes, 2009).

This religious identity that is inherent in ‘Aisyiyah applicatively distanced it from the press agentry model even though most of its activities were related to publications and imaging in the media. The identity inherent in the culture to always be honest with the public and not apply the frontal path is also a capital for faith-based organizations such as ‘Aisyiyah to be in the continuum of two-way communication directions and symmetrical communication effects. In this case, I see that faith-based organization, with all their limitations that cannot be separated from donors and volunteers, can take a step forward on a model that focuses on the effect of communication and ethical side heuristically. I named it the ethical-asymmetrical model. This model is proposed by focusing on two things. First, as discussed above, organizations with religious identities such as ‘Aisyiyah tend not to violate ethical corridors. Second, non-profit organizations such as ‘Aisyiyah are bound to two things that are not separated, donors and volunteers. In the case of ‘Aisyiyah, the lack of human resources was allegedly the main trigger of the subordination of PR institution to the secretary. This limitation makes the application of the symmetrical PR model become utopian. Nonetheless, nonprofit organizations such as ‘Aisyiyah can advance at an asymmetrical level. At the very least, at this level, public relations activities are not only dominated by publications but up to the planning to evaluation stages involving verification research to understand the public and clarify its public definitions through audience segmentation.

CONCLUSION

The findings highlight that CBA PR application were dominated by public information model. This model tends to lead to one-way, asymmetrical, mediated, and ethics. Thus, it can be concluded that CBA PR application at the organizational level have not been effective.

Meanwhile, the subordination of the public relations department into secretary conducted in the period 2010 - 2015 did not significantly affect the implementation of public relations models. This period is only reproduce PR activities for the period 2005 - 2010. Even in some cases, the subordination is actually detrimental to the organization both in terms of the concept of public relations program planning and the quantity of PR products.

The application is caused by several factors. These factors include the PR knowledge and skill of most top management organizations as well as the chairperson and members of PR department, the differences in perspectives between top managers and the public relations department in looking at the PR performance, and the less optimal of organization participative culture.

In addition, the dominance of public information model by CBA with publication as its main orientation contributes one important thing. In general, this theory indicates that PR publication orientation in organizations will encourage the application of the press agentry model as the dominant model used. However, for ‘Aisyiyah, this is not proven. The organizational identity as a faith-based women organization encourages organizations to adopt ethical principles in the PR practices. This makes CBA PR application, though not ideal, but with determination to its ethics, more inclined to the public information model.

Based on the research findings, I suggest faith-based organizations to conduct PR as a management function integratively. Thus, PR activities are not only carried out by communication technicians but also communication managers or planners. The suggestion for the next research is to expand the research subject, not only PR policy makers of faith-based women, but also their related stakeholders. In this case, the public response to CBA public relations activities is interesting to be studied. Moreover, the scope of this research should be expanded through comparison with the characteristics of PR in other faith-based women organizations.
REFERENCES


