

The effectiveness of the material experience program national examination in vocational high schools

Nurul Chairani ¹, Siti Mariah ²

¹ SMKN 1 Pandak, Bantul, Indonesia

² Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
E-mail: ¹nurulchairani71@yahoo.com; siti.mariah@ustjogja.ac.id

Abstracts. This study aims to determine the effectiveness of the deepening program of national exam materials of vocational students in Bantul District. This research is evaluation research with CPRP (Context, Input, Process, and Product) evaluation model from Stufflebeam using quantitative approach supported by qualitative. Data were collected using questionnaires, interviews, observations, and documentation. The results of the research are, first, the context is very useful, shown by organizational program organizers have been structured, and the program is very relevant to the needs of students; Second, the input is quite effective, the readiness of the students to follow the program and management has been well managed, the program plan is very effective, the program strategy is quite effective, and the learning media is very useful; Third, the process is quite effective indicated by the level of student participation in the implementation of the morning is lower than the daytime. Learning process according to program planning; Fourth, the product aspect is very effective with the benefits of the program.

Keywords: effectivity, material experience, evaluation program

Introduction

The National Examination (UN) is no longer the only determinant of student graduation. Final Value is a combination of school grades and UN scores with a ratio of 50% of school grades and 50% of UN scores. Based on Minister of Education and Culture No. 57 of 2015 it was stated that the results of the 2015/2016 National Examination were used to map the quality of Education Unit programs, consider selection into the next education level and later as consideration in fostering and providing assistance to the Education Unit in an effort to improve education quality.

The education unit including the Vocational High School (SMK) in Bantul Regency strives to increase or at least maintain the UN scores that have been obtained by students in the previous school year. Efforts carried out by the school include giving motivation to students of class XII in the form of Achievement Motivation Training (AMT) and Out Bond as well as a material improvement program mastered by students in facing the National Examination with a material deepening program.

The material deepening program is a program carried out to increase student

knowledge based on school policy. Experience shows that ignorance or intelligence factors do not always cause the failures experienced by students in learning, but that factor is produced by students not getting adequate learning guidance, Prayitno, and Amti in Alif (2010: 18) while Syamsul Yusuf in Alif (2010: 18) states that tutoring is guidance directed at helping students to deal with and solve academic problems by developing conducive teaching and learning atmosphere to avoid learning difficulties. While according to Sumarna (2009: 23) guidance is a process of providing assistance, advice or guidance to individuals or groups of students in dealing with problems so that they can know well to overcome the issues at hand. From this understanding, it can be seen that guidance is primarily an academic process of assistance so students can solve problems that must be resolved immediately.

This material deepening program is carried out outside regular lesson hours, namely before or after the learning process. The subjects intensified in the material are all issues that will be tested in the UN. It is expected that the deepening of this material can improve student achievement in learning by providing quality learning that is more appropriate, can help and

give special attention to students who are slow to master competency and basic competency standards and offer enrichment programs for students who achieve early learning completeness.

The material deepening program has almost become a kind of tradition for Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency. Since the existence of National Exams the schools in Bantul Regency, especially Vocational Schools, have implemented material deepening programs for their students. In its application in schools, the deepening of material can be useful, but it can also be ineffective in increasing the readiness of students in facing the National Examination. The deepening of the National Examination material will be effective if it is provided with planning, management and methods that are suitable with the goals and needs of students, whereas the implementation of UN material deepening without proper planning, management and techniques will only provide additional burdens to students providing material readiness, strategy and mentality of students in facing the National Examination will not be achieved. But the implementation of the deepening of the material often gets blocked, so it is impressed that the implementation of the deepening of the material is less effective for increasing student grades.

Obstacles that can be seen from the implementation of this material deepening program come from students in the document deepening program such as the lack of student participation in the material deepening program due to students' ignorance of the importance of this material deepening program. Learning media and barriers from the manager of the material deepening program that only evaluates the results of element increasing but does not evaluate the material deepening program. So if there is an error/incompatibility with the program that has been implemented, no evaluation has been made towards the improvement of the program.

Program evaluation is critical to do as an effort to find out the effectiveness of program components in supporting the achievement of program objectives. So, if it is known that learning outcomes (as the expectations of the learning program) are not satisfactory, it can be found where the shortcomings are located or which components work improperly.

Considering the importance of the national exam material deepening program but the emergence of several problems from the implementation of this program so that it seems less effective, it is necessary to research to evaluate the implementation of the material deepening program.

Research Method

This research is an evaluation study with the CIPP evaluation model (Context, Input, Process, and Product) from Stufflebeam using a quantitative approach supported by a qualitative approach. The population in this study is the Vocational School in Bantul Regency that implements the program of deepening the material, sampling based on consideration (purposive sampling). The schools that were sampled in this study were two public schools, and one private school, namely N 1 Bantul Vocational School, Pandak N 1 Vocational School, and Bantul Health Vocational School.

The source of this research data is the principal as the person in charge of the material deepening program, the deputy headmaster of the affairs of the curriculum as the coordinator, the teacher increasing the material as many as 40 teachers and students participating in the material deepening as many as 334 students. Data collection is done by interview, observation, documentation, and questionnaire. Qualitative data collection using questionnaire instruments while quantitative data uses interview, observation and documentation guidelines.

Test the validity of quantitative data (questionnaire) using the validity test empirical validity where the questionnaire is used in samples that are not the study sample. The score obtained is calculated using the Product Moment correlation coefficient from Karl Pearson. After the r count is found then consult with r table to find out the items that are valid and invalid. If the r count is greater or equal to r table at a significant level of 5%, then the item statement is accurate. The reliability test method used is internal consistency method reliability using Cronbach's Alpha (α). The level of reliability of the instrument is determined based on the reliability coefficient possessed — the higher the reliability coefficient, the lower the measurement error. Criteria for a research instrument are said to be reliable using this

technique if the reliability coefficient (r_{11}) > 0.6 (Syofian, 2011: 175). The results of the validity test show that the three items in the student questionnaire are invalid so they are not used and all the things in the teacher questionnaire are valid so that they can be used as instruments. While the reliability test results, both reliable questionnaires.

The validity of quantitative data uses triangulation. Triangulation is a technique of checking the validity of data that uses something else outside the information for testing purposes or as a comparison to that data (Moelong, 2007: 330). In fulfilling the validity of the data, this research was conducted with sources. According to Patton, triangulation with sources means comparing and checking the degree of trust in information obtained through different tools and time in qualitative research (Moelong, 2007: 29). Triangulation with sources carried out in this study is to compare the results of interviews with the contents of related documents.

This study is an evaluative descriptive study that aims to provide an overview of the scope of the program deepening the material to be evaluated. The data analysis technique used is descriptive analysis. Quantitative data analysis (questionnaire) using categorization based on the standard curve area is divided into five categories to conclude (Sudijono, 2011: 329). Assessing the effectiveness of each component of the study based on the types as shown in table 1.

Table 1. Assessment criteria based on scores on the standard curve

Range	Criteria
skor $M - 1,5 SD$	very low
$M - 1,5 SD \leq \text{score} < M - 0,5 SD$	low
$M - 0,5 SD \leq \text{score} < M + 0,5 SD$	enough
$M + 0,5 SD \leq \text{skor} < M + 1,5 SD$	high
$\text{skor} \geq M + 1,5 SD$	very high

$M = \frac{1}{2} (\text{Max. Score} + \text{Min. Score})$
 $SD = \frac{1}{6} (\text{Max. Score} + \text{Min. Score})$

Processing data that is quantitative, the presentation of the data in the form of a percentage which is then described and drawn conclusions about each factor and indicator based on the specified criteria. To find out the trend of each element used the ideal mean score and the typical standard deviation score. Based on the M value (usual mean) and SD (standard deviation)

Qualitative data processing (interviews, observation, and documentation) has been carried out since the beginning of the activity until the end of the activity with the expectation of consistency in data analysis. Analysis of data used by researchers so that data becomes more easily understood and more meaningful, is data analysis of Interactive Analysis Model from Mills and Huberman (Miles et al, 1994: 23) which divides data analysis activities into several parts, namely: data collection, grouping according to variables, data reduction, data presentation, separating data outliers and drawing conclusions or verifying data.

Research Results

The research results are described by the stages of CIPP evaluation research as follows:

Management organization

This material deepening program was led directly by the vice principal of the curriculum field and was operationally handled by a special committee. The school has an organization that organizes programs for deepening material even though the arrangement is not the same.

The relevance of the program to the needs of students

The material deepening program in SMK is relevant to the needs of students. With this program, students are ready to face the national final examination both regarding content, strategy, and mentality. This is in accordance with the results of the interview: "the material deepening program is carried out to meet the needs of students ready to face national examinations even though the school has not been able to meet all student needs, such as the daytime implementation, certainly not comfortable for students, but the school has no alternative time the application of the material deepening program in addition to daylight hours due to the intense activity of students from 7:00 to 14.30.

Student readiness

The effectiveness of the material deepening program can be seen from the preparedness of students to take part in the deepening program of national exam materials at school. Student readiness includes physical preparation and mental readiness. The results of the questionnaire that shows the readiness of

students to take part in the national exam material deepening program can be seen in the distribution of data in table 2.

Table 2. Results categorization of students' readiness to take part in the material deepening program

Categorization	Range	f	(%)
Very low	< 6,75	55	16,47
Low	6,75 – 7,92	59	17,66
Enough	7,92 – 9,08	143	42,81
High	9,08 – 10,25	39	11,68
Very high	> 10,25	38	11,38
	Sum	334	100

From Table 2., the readiness of students to take part in the overall material deepening program shows that the frequency (f) is highest in the intervals of 7.92 - 9.08, as much as 42.81% in the sufficient category. The observation results showed that the readiness of students to take part in the program during the daytime was better prepared than the implementation in the morning. Students are already in class before the learning process, and the attendance rate is also higher.

Program Management

The implementation of the material deepening program was carried out with the same management as the implementation of regular teaching and learning activities. At the planning stage, the deputy headmaster of the curriculum field has a draft conceptualization program. The contents of the design concept deepening program include the goals and objectives of the material increases, criteria for teaching material/teaching material increasing, planning, strategies and learning media designed by teachers of material increasing (facilitators) along with the design of material evaluation program. Then the draft is submitted as a material with a meeting with the team and teacher (facilitator) prospective instructors in the material depth.

All of the indicators of the management of the material deepening program at Bantul Regency Vocational School were achieved so that the input aspects are reviewed from program management by the symbols.

Program Plan

Data from the program plan results can be seen in the following table.

Table 3. Results of teacher categorization plan deepening program plan

Categorization	Range	f	(%)
Very low	< 12,50	1	2,50
Low	12,50 – 14,17	3	7,50
Enough	14,17 – 15,83	3	7,50
High	15,83 – 17,50	8	20,00
Very high	> 17,50	25	62,50
	Sum	40	100

Table 3 shows the program deepening program plan conducted by the teacher who has the highest frequency (f) at intervals > 17.50 for 25 with a very high level of effectiveness of 62.5%.

The teacher plans a real deepening program by preparing the material that students will learn. Planning includes content to be delivered. The following is a transcript of the interview with KS01: "... *the teacher has prepared the material to be delivered in the implementation of the material deepening program*". For math subjects, Indonesian and English using SPM (Material Deepening Questions) from publishers while for productive matters, the material comes from productive subject teachers. This is per the results of observations in the classroom when the article deepening program takes place that the teacher uses material that has been planned.

Learning strategies

The material deepening learning strategy program by the teaching teacher has the highest frequency (f) in the intervals of 14.92 - 16.08, i.e., as many as 18 with a sufficient level of the category that is equal to 45.00%, as in table 4.

Table 4. Results of the learning strategy categorization by the teacher

Categorization	Range	f	%
Very low	< 13,75	4	10,00
Low	13,75 – 14,92	9	22,50
Enough	14,92 – 16,08	18	45,00
High	16,08 – 17,25	4	10,00
Very high	> 17,25	5	12,50
	Sum	40	100

The learning strategy in the material deepening program prepared by the teacher is like a strategy so that students are more accessible to do the questions. The following are excerpts from observations: The teacher discusses one by one the issues that have just been heard, by playing back the tape recorder,

the teacher shows the type of the question, the trick/method quickly answers correctly while giving direction questions to students.

Instructional Media

The material deepening learning media by the teaching teacher has the highest frequency (f) at intervals > 18.25 which is as many as 16 with a very high category level of 40.00%, as shown in the following table.

Table 5. Results of learning media categorization by teachers

Categorization	Range	f	%
Very low	< 14,75	5	12,50
Low	14,75 – 15,92	4	10,00
Enough	15,92 – 17,08	13	32,50
High	17,08 – 18,25	2	5,00
Very high	> 18,25	16	40,00
Sum		40	100

The teacher prepares the deepening learning media in the form of books about material deepening questions from the publisher or arranges itself and tools in the way of using a tape recorder when needed for listening learning (English subjects) Besides that the use of learning media other than books is also used by teachers to help students understand the material being studied. Following are the results of the interview transcript: "Yes ... there is a teacher who uses a tape recorder ...". The results of the observation showed that at 15.00-15.50 the teacher turned on the tape recorder with a question that was by the SPM book "then" the students listened to a tape recorder while answering the questions on the SPM in English."

Student Participation Level

The level of student participation in taking part in the material deepening program is an indicator of the suitability of the program to deepen the material with the needs of students so that the motivation of students to take part in the program's increasing program activities will be high. From the results of observations and interviews, it was found that the learning activities in material deepening were generally responded enthusiastically to the students at the beginning of the event, but the longer the activity and motivation of students in participating in the learning activities of the material deepening decreased. This is mainly due to physical fatigue factors for those who carry out the material deepening during the day after the regular lesson

ends. The following are the results of interviews with students who conducted material deepening after proper learning ended: "Deepening the material during the day, I have felt tired and sleepy because I have been studying since the morning, and hungry because there is very little time between lessons with the beginning of material deepening lessons and not had lunch " While for the implementation of material deepening in the morning, student participation also did not reach 100%. The school applied material increasing time in the morning because the students were fresher in receiving the lessons in the morning, but what happened was that many students who did not attend the material deepening program because they arrived late were caused by not being able to get up early.

Quality of Program Implementation

Student responses to the quality of program implementation are insufficient categories as in table 6.

Table 6. Categorization results of student responses to quality of program implementation

Categorization	Range	f	%
Very low	< 44,00	46	13,77
Low	44,00 – 50,00	98	29,34
Enough	50,00 – 56,00	104	31,14
High	56,00 – 62,00	67	20,06
Very high	> 62,00	19	5,69
Sum		334	100

Fourth, the product, student response to the material deepening program in the high category as can be seen in the following table.

Table 7. Categorization results of student responses to quality of program implementation

Categorization	Range	f	%
Very low	< 10,50	1	0,30
Low	10,50 – 13,50	24	7,19
Enough	13,50 – 16,50	105	31,44
High	16,50 – 19,50	130	38,92
Very high	> 19,50	74	22,16
Jumlah		334	100

Based on these data, the results of the implementation of the material deepening program at Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency, regarding their products have a high level of effectiveness. Conversely, the lowest frequency is at intervals of <10.50, as many as one respondents or 0.30%. This shows that only

one respondent or 0.30% who assessed the results of the implementation of the material deepening program for Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency, regarding its products had a very low level of effectiveness.

Discussion

Evaluation of the deepening program material carried out at Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency was carried out with Program Evaluation CIPP evaluation model (Context, Input, Process, and Product) from Stufflebeam using a quantitative approach supported by a qualitative approach.

Organization of program implementation

The organizational structure and person in charge of the program for material deepening activities at each research school already exists. The substance deepening program was under the direct responsibility of the Principal, and then it was operationally handled by a special team led by the deputy headmaster of the curriculum. The group consists of teachers and employees. The composition of the group aims to assert the duties, responsibilities, and authorities of each party so that each component in the group can carry out their duties and facilitate coordination and administrative forms applied in the material deepening program. Although the composition of the team is not the same from the sample school studied, the team at the implementation of the deepening program can carry out tasks according to their functions. This is by the opinion of Harold Koontz and Hein Welrich (in Kambey, 2006: 2), namely that the existence of an organization will gather people who work together to achieve the same goals so that the results of their work are maximized.

The relevance of the program to the needs of students.

The relevance of the material deepening program with student needs is very relevant, with the UAN material increasing program, students can know the description of the material, techniques, strategies in answering the questions. Also, the material deepening program provides an overview of the types of UAN questions so that it will increase students' self-confidence in facing UAN.

Material deepening is one form of effective learning. According to Salahuddin (2012: 4), one of the indicators of active learning is the material

being studied has a high level of supremacy to be learned. The concentration of students will be full of essential and primary material to learn.

Student Readiness

The level of input effectiveness in the readiness of students to take part in the material deepening program is sufficient. The material deepening program is carried out in the morning before regular learning begins and some are held in the afternoon after proper education ends. The implementation of the intensifying material program in the morning which was started at 6:00 a.m. was felt by some students. The school stipulates the application of the material deepening program in the morning because students take part in a plan to increase this material more freshly and students more readily accept the material. But for some students departing and attending school at 6:00 a.m., it was felt heavy. While schools that carry out material deepening programs during the day are also perceived to be difficult for some students. This is caused by students feeling tired, sleepy and hungry after attending regular learning activities since morning. Based on this, students need to be motivated to increase awareness following the material deepening, and the school needs to prepare an environment that supports the implementation of the material deepening program. The situation that helps the learning process will minimize the concentration of students (Salehudin, 2012: 4).

Program management

The school has implemented a deepening material management program, which includes the objectives and targets of material deepening, sources of teaching materials, plans, strategies and learning media prepared by the teacher who is capable of deepening the material, and monitoring and evaluating the implementation of the material deepening program. The purpose of the material deepening is to prepare students to face the UAN; the target is all students of class XII. The source of teaching materials uses the Material Deepening Question book (SPM) along with the material and questions prepared by the teacher based on the UAN grid. The principal is directly responsible for the supervision of the program, while it is operationally carried out by the deputy headmaster of the curriculum. Program monitoring includes the attendance list of material deepening teams, teachers and students while program evaluation is carried out

at the end of the material deepening program after the implementation of the National Examination. The results of the assessment in the 2015/2016 school year are the basis for the application of the material deepening program for the 2016/2017 school year. Periodically the real increasing program team conducts a coordination meeting between the teaching teacher and the team to evaluate the material deepening program being carried out.

Program Plan

The material deepening program plan prepared by the teacher (facilitator) shows a very high level of effectiveness. The teacher plans a real deepening program before implementation by preparing material and learning media. The teacher makes the equipment for the deepening of his material or chooses a book that contains questions about the deepening of the material by the UAN grid.

Learning strategies

The program strategy for deepening the material by the teaching teacher shows a sufficient level of effectiveness. Not all teachers feel confident that they have developed a plan that can overcome students' learning difficulties in dealing with UAS. Sometimes the teacher applies the same learning strategy between regular learning and material deepening learning. The teacher applies the same learning strategies to different classes and has different student characteristics. Differences in student characteristics are seen from different skill programs that are followed by students. The results of classroom observations show that the teacher has provided quick tricks and methods in answering questions. The teacher also tries to approach students who still do not have an understanding of the mastery of the material being studied. According to Ahmad, et al. (2014: 9) one of the characteristics of effective teachers is the teacher who understands students and can use various learning strategies. Active learning is obtained from competent teachers.

Instructional Media

The level of effectiveness of the learning media in the material deepening program prepared by the teacher is very high. The teacher provides learning media in the form of a book about the deepening of material from the publisher or content that has been prepared by the teaching teacher himself / along with the

subject teacher team. The school provides facilities in the form of the availability of learning media in the way of books/photocopies of material and other media needed to support the implementation of element deepening programs such as tape recorders for the application of listening material in learning English. Students feel easier in accepting subject matter in the presence of learning media. Problems arise if the material prepared by the teacher itself is different in discussion between the teacher (facilitator) in the same subject. Students will be confused so that the objectives of the material deepening program are not achieved. Therefore the teacher should in one matter have the same discussion of the material to be delivered to students.

Student participation

There are differences in the level of student participation in material deepening program activities between students who take part in the material deepening program in the morning with students who take part in the material deepening program during the day. The level of participation of students who take part in the material increasing program in the morning is lower than students who take part in the material deepening program during the day. The deepening of the material carried out during the daytime is a continuation of the learning activities at the previous time. So students tend to have higher levels of participation, unlike the material deepening program that was held in the morning. This program is an activity that begins student learning activities on that day. Students tend to feel that they do not have a significant burden if they do not take part in this program.

Moreover the school does not impose sanctions on students who do not follow the material deepening. Students can attend regular learning programs even though they do not take part in the material deepening program. The research data shows that the level of student participation at the beginning of the program has increased but has declined throughout the deepening program activities. This is due to internal factors and external factors for students — external factors in the form of a decrease in motivation due to various influences such as the environment (friends who are not disciplined and not sanctioned, monotonous material, less sympathetic teacher, less different strategies and

internal influences such as mood, anxiety, and minimal fighting power (laziness).

Quality of program implementation

The results of the student questionnaire showed that the effectiveness of the program implementation was sufficient and tended to be low. The quality of the material deepening program is seen from the readiness of students before, while and after the implementation of the material deepening program. Before the implementation includes preparing to take part in the material deepening program, while the application consists of the activity of participating in the material deepening program and after the implementation includes repeating and relearning the material that has been studied and student responses to the learning process provided by the teacher. Input aspects which include plans, strategies, and media deepening learning media prepared by the teacher, in general, can be stated to have a high level of effectiveness. Therefore students' responses to the quality of the program's deepening program have sufficient effectiveness and tend to be low due to the factors themselves. Students need to be given motivation, enthusiasm and the importance of participating in a material deepening program besides that the material is deepening program management team also needs to pay attention to the needs of students in taking part in the material deepening program regarding implementation time, so that no students feel still drowsy, lazy, tired and hungry while attending a material deepening program.

The quality of the material deepening program requires commitment and cooperation from every component involved. The parties include the committee / implementing team for material deepening programs, students, parents and related agencies such as the Education Office in developing program plans and strategies for deepening the material that is effective by the learning objectives and according to the needs of students.

The quality of the material deepening program at Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency can be seen from the level of student discipline, teacher readiness in teaching, non-empty hours of study, student attendance of more than 70% and evaluation of the quality of material deepening programs seen from the success of material deep learning activities measured from the try out. The results of

increased tryouts generally predict the outcomes of learning deepening the material in the form of students' ability to take the national final exam optimally.

Fourth, Product

The effectiveness of the product or the results of the material deepening program in the form of the benefits of a material deepening program for high students Even though the process aspects (student responses to the quality of the material deepening program implementation) are quite useful, they tend to be low, but students feel that the UAN material increasing program is beneficial for students in preparing for the 2016/2017 academic year. Students think this program helps to recall the learning material that has been learned recognizes the form and type of UAN questions, thereby increasing students' self-confidence. Positive student responses to the benefits of the material deepening program show the purpose of implementing the material deepening program.

Conclusion

The effectiveness of the implementation of the national exam material deepening program conducted in Vocational Schools in Bantul Regency viewed from the aspect of Context, Input, Process and Products is: Context has a high level of effectiveness, it is shown that the organization of tutoring is structured and the material deepening program is very relevant students to improve students' readiness to deal with national final examination measurements. Inputs have a sufficient level of effectiveness (42.81% in the range 7.92-9.08), regarding the readiness of students to take part in the deepening of the final national examination material program. The management of the material deepening program has been well managed, the effectiveness of the program's deepening program plan is very high (62.50% in the range > 17.50), the effectiveness of the program's deepening program strategy is sufficient (45% in the range 14.92-16, 08) and the effectiveness of learning media prepared by teachers is very high (40% in the field > 18.25). The process has a sufficient level of effectiveness (31.14% in the range 50.00 - 56.00) regarding the level of student participation in the implementation of the morning material deepening program is lower than the implementation of the daytime

deepening program. The program learning process deepening the material goes according to program planning, the teacher (facilitator) performs the tasks well and by their authority. Products / results have a high level of effectiveness (38.92% in the range 16.50 - 19.50) in terms of the benefits of the program for students, which are able to know the form and type of questions, tricks to work quickly and correctly so as to provide confidence to students in the face of national final exams.

References

- Alif Sumiarsih (2010). Pelaksanaan Program Bimbingan Belajar Biologi di Sekolah dalam Menghadapi Ujian Nasional (UN) SMA/MA se Kabupaten Sragen Tahun 2010. Skripsi. Universitas Negeri Semarang.
- Ahmad, dkk (2014). Karakteristik guru efektif dalam Perspektif Psikologi Pendidikan. Makalah. Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa Arab. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.
- Kambey, Daniel C. (2006). Landasan Teori Administrasi/Manajemen. Manado : Tri Ganesha Nusantara.
- Salehudin (2012). Metode Belajar dan Pembelajaran yang efektif. Jurnal Adabiyah, ISSN 1421-6141 Vol. XII No I/2012.
- Sumarna (2009). Persepsi Siswa Tentang Keefektivan Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran Tambahan (Les) di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri (MAN) Kabupaten Bantul. Tesis. Program Pasca Sarjana. Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta.